MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI
No.: DyChEng/BP/009848/WS-I dt. 20/7/2020

Sub:- Dilapidated condition of building known as "Bungalow No.124". Shaheed Bhagat Singh CHSL, AGLR, Andheri(E), Mumbai 400 069.

MINUTES OF TAC MEETING HELD UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF DY.CH.ENG. (B.P.) W.S.-I ON 2nd March 2020, AT 03.00 pm

In this case, the meeting was held on 14.02.2019 to decide the condition of the building known as "Bungalow No.124, in Shaheed Bhagat Sing CHS Ltd.", Gurunanak Nagar, Andheri Ghatkoper Link Road, Andheri (E), Mumbai 400 059.

As per the discussions in the said meeting, it is decided to appoint I.I.T. Institution Mumbai as a Structural Consultant and obtain structural audit report. As per instructions, I.I.T. Institution Mumbai has submitted the SAR on dtd. 14.02.2020.

Accordingly, the meeting was called upon for the purpose of dilapidated condition of the building known as "Bungalow No.124, in Shaheed Bhagat Sing CHS Ltd.", Gurunanak Nagar, Andheri Ghatkoper Link Road, Andheri (E), Mumbai 400 059 in K/East Ward.

Preamble:-

1) Name and Address of the building:- "Banglow No.124, in Shaheed Bhagat Sing CHS Ltd", Gurunanak Nagar, Andheri Ghatkoper Link Road, Andheri (E), Mumbai 400 059.

2) Year of Construction/ Age of the building:- Around 50 years

3) Type of structure:- R.C.C. framed structure

4) Number of Floors:- Ground + 1

5) Details of Correspondence by User Dept. in respect of building u/r :-

In this case, one of the occupier Shri Narendra Kumar Jasuja had submitted the Structural Audit Report conducted by the M/s.STRUCT-LIFE on 20.04.2015 and the Structural Engineer had classified the building in C-2B category i.e. No eviction only structural repairs.

Accordingly, K/East Staff visited and inspected the site under reference. During Site inspection, it is observed that the building is around 35 years old and in highly dilapidated condition, K/East Ward office has issued following notices :

Sr. no.	Notice /Letter Issued	Notice /Letter Issued U/No.	Reason to issue Notice /Letter	Issued to owner/ tenant/ occupier.	Remarks.
1	Notice u/s 353B of MMC Act	KE/JE(B-76)/2172/353(B)/B & F/2014 dated 26.04.2014	Building is seen beyond 30 years of age	Owner / Occupier/ tenants	To carry out structural audit of the building and submit report to MCGM

Scanned by CamScanner

2	Notice u/s 354 of MMC Act	KE/JEB-76/2576/BF dtd.06.05.2015	Building is in reinous condition	Owner / Occupier/ tenants	To pull down the building.

In this case, the building consisting of G + 1 RCC residential structure and as the building under reference is constructed in 1964, the notice u/s 353(B) of MMC act u/No. KE/JE(B-76)/2172/353(B)/B&F/2014 dtd.26.04.2014 was issued to the Owner. One of the occupier Shri Narendra Kumar Jasuja had submitted the structural audit report conducted by M/s.Struct-Life on 20.04.2015 and submitted the Proforma-B on 29.04.2015 and classified the building in C-2B category i.e. No eviction only structural repairs.

Subsequently, K/East Ward office had issued a notice u/s 354 of MMC Act vide No. ACKE/JEB-76/2576/BF dtd.06.05.2015 to the Owner and occupier to repair the above referred building. On expiry of notice, K/East Ward office inspected the site on 18.06.2015 but the Owner/occupiers of the building have failed to carry out the necessary repairs as recommended by the Structural Consultant M/Struct-Life. Hence, K/East Ward office has initiated the prosecution action against the Owner by initiating to Jr.L.A. K/East Ward vide No. ACKE/294/Gen/BF dtd.26.05.2015.

Meanwhile the owner of the building Shri Jagdishsing Chandok through his advocate Shri Devmani Shukla had submitted reply to the notice consist of the Structural Audit Report conducted by the Structural Engineer M/s.RNR Consulting Engineers (Municipal Penal Registered Structural Audit No. STR/D/128) on 13.07.2015 stating that the building is in very dilapidated condition & building has out time its life and categorised the building as **C-1** based on the NDT Test Report carried out.

Meanwhile on 25.07.2015, the front portion of 1st floor and part portion of terrace slab was collapsed. Hence, the hanging portion was removed with the help of JC and the 1st floor was locked.

Due to two contradictory Audit Report, matter referred to BP & TAC.

Meanwhile one of the occupier Mr.Narendra Kumar Jasuja filed W.P. in High Court u/No. 2714/2016, wherein Hon'ble High Court ordered on dtd.27.11.2017 Corporation that to refer the matter to TAC.

6) Details of Correspondence by User Dept. with TAC:-

Ward Executive Engineer K/East Ward had submitted the file papers on 24.08.2015 to Director (ES & P) I/c. for TAC opinion. Director (ES & P) issued note to Assistant Commissioner K/East Ward and requested to direct the concerned staff to scrutinize the file papers/test result and Proforma B submitted by Owner/Occupiers/Structural Auditor and returned the complete file papers u/No. Dir/ES&P/2984/II dt. 01.09.2015.

Assistant Commissioner, K/East Ward submitted the file papers on 14.01.2019 for TAC opinion. Accordingly, TAC site inspection was arranged on 14.02.2019 and meeting held on the same date.

After going through the detailed report of consultants and as per actual site visit and as decided in TAC meeting held on 14.02.2019, Designated Officer-II (K/East Ward) will appoint I.I.T. Institution Mumbai as a Structural Consultant and obtain Structural Audit Report within 45 days and submit file with Audit Report for further decision.

Scanned by CamScanner

In view of above, it is proposed to pay an amount of Rs.3,54,000/- (Inc.GST) in advance to IIT Mumbai for carrying out fresh structural audit of said building as per TAC direction. The said amount is recovered from the Owner of the structure through his assessment levy.

After that IIT Institution Mumbai has submitted the structure audit report to Ward office on dtd. 14.02.2020 and mentioned category is C-1 of said building and to be evacuated/demolished immediately.

Thereafter, Designated Officer (B&F) /Exe.Eng. K/East Ward submitted the file papers u/No. ACKE/1939/Gen/BF on 17.02.2020 for TAC opinion. Accordingly, meeting was held on 02.03.2020 under the chairmanship of Dy.Ch.E.(B.P.)W.S.I and the entire submission by K/East ward were kept before the TAC members.

The following Officers/Consultants were present for the meeting:-

Sr. No.	Name of Officers/Consultants	Designation
1.	Shri. S.Y.Thatte	Member, TAC (K/East ward) (Representing Member Secretary TAC K/East Ward)
2.	Shri C.D.Chaudhari	Member, TAC (BP Department)
3.	Shri Dhaware Mahendra	Structural Consultant of M/s.RNR Consulting
4.	Shri Sandeep Pawar	Structural Consultant of M/s. Square Consultant
5.	Absent	Structural Consultant of M/s.IIT Institution

7) Details of Structural Audit Report (SAR), Proforma 'B' and Technical aspects Received by the User Dept.:-

Sr. no.	SAR and Proforma 'B' Submitted by Tenant/ Owner/ Trust/ Etc.	Date of submission	Date of Inspection by Structural Engineer.	Name of the Consultant/ Institute submitting SAR and Proforma- 'B'.	Category of Building as per SAR and Proforma- 'B'.
1	**MCGM**	29.01.2019	14.02.2020	Dr.Muhammad Salman Dr.R.S.Jangid	**C-1 category (To be evacuated and demolished)**
	Critical observations /Conclusion as per SAR / says of consultant				
	The said 'Bungalow No.124, Shaheed Bhagat Singh CHSL' comprises of Ground + 1 upper floors, age is above 50 years old structure. It is RCC framed structure (Residential). The said building was surveyed both from external and internal side. The said building is observed partially damaged. Vegetation growth observed on plumbing line and all around the structure. In column area structural steel was found corroded. Observed signs of seepage on the structure. Parapet wall at terrace found damaged. Corrosion cracks are found in chajjas. Most of the structural members are showing severe sign of distress due to aging, seepage and leakage, extensive corrosion of steel reinforcements, alterations made to the structure and extensive vegetation. Many of the RCC members of the buildings do not have adequate strength and most of them have poor structural integrity.				

Scanned by CamScanner

	UPV test –: (=0.4 Km/s) which indicates that the concrete of the structural members of the building having doubtful grading exhibiting high degree of looseness. Rebound Hammer Test – indicates the concrete strength of most of the comlumns and beams is inadequate. Carbonation depth measurement Test :- carbonated and corrosion in the reinforcement. Core test :-Not carried out Chemical Analysis – Not carried out The process of deterioration is continues and the level of distress will go on increasing with time. Looking into the present condition, it is stated that the Bungalow No.124, Shaheed Bhagat Singh CHSL is in a distressed condition endangering its safety and stability at present. The building is beyond any logical repairs and classified the buildings' category is C-1 (to be evacuated and demolished immediately).

Non-Destructive test results as per PROFORMA 'B' Form submitted by above said Consultants in their respective Structural Audit Reports is as follows-

Sr. No.	Tests	IIT Institution 's findings	Criteria
1	UPV Test	= 0.4 km/s	>3 km/s
2	Rebound hammer test	average 18 MPa but <10 MPa	>25 Mpa
3	Half cell potential test mV	-411 Mv (Average)	(-350 mV to+ 200 mv)
4	Carbonation Depth test	30 mm	<5 mm
5	Core test	Extracting core sample was not possible	NA
6	Chemical Analysis	Not Applicable	Max. 06 kg of Cl/m3 of concrete, 4% SO3 by mass of cement in the concrete mix
7	Cement aggregate ratio	Not Applicable	1:2:4
8	**Classification**	**C1 (to evacuate and demolish)**	

TAC Observation and remarks :

In view of the earlier decision of TAC on 14.02.2019, on submission of Structural Audit Report from IIT Mumbai, TAC meeting was held on 02.03.2020 at 3.00 pm. In the meeting, structural audit reports of all the structural consultants' alongwith Structural Audit Report submitted by IIT Mumbai were taken into consideration.

Scanned by CamScanner

Conclusion:

In this case, after going through the details from all the consultants and site visit, Considering age of building, both the structural consultants' test result, site observation and more specifically after going through the Structural Audit Report submitted by IIT Mumbai and further discussion in the meeting, it is unanimously recommended that the structure known as "Bungalow No.124, in Shaheed Bhagat Sing CHS Ltd", Gurunanak Nagar, Andheri Ghatkoper Link Road, Andheri (E), Mumbai 400 059 falls in C-1 category and should be vacated and pulled down immediately following due process of law as the said building is unsafe for habitation

Designated Officer/Ward E.E., K/East ward shall therefore take necessary action as per the policy guidelines dated 25.05.2018.

(Shri C.D.Chaudhari)
Ex.Engr (B.P.) W.S. K ward
(Member, TAC)

(Shri. Thatte)
D.O./Ward Ex.Eng. K/East ward
(Member TAC)
Representing Member
Secretary, TAC

17/03/2020

(Shri. Ulhas V.Mahale)
Chairman,
Technical Advisory Committee
for Private Buildings in
Western Suburbs I
and Dy.Chief Engineer (B.P.) W.S.-I

Scanned by CamScanner