MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI

Office of Dy.Ch.E.(Building Proposal) W.S.-I, Hinduhriday Samrat Shri Balasaheb Thakare Mandai, New Majas Market, 6th to 9th floor, Opp. J.V.L.R., Poonam Nagar, Jogeshwari (E), Mumbai 400 093.

No.Dy.Ch.Engr.(B.P.)/ 008405 /W.S.-I dated **22.06.2021**

23 JUN 2021

Sub:- Structural Audit Report of the building known as "Bashiron CHSL" Plot No. 45, 28th Road, Bandra (West), Mumbai 400 050 in H/West Ward.

Ref:- ACHW/SR/2977/AE-II/FO-100/B&F dtd. 30.03.2021

With reference to the above subject, the hearing order in respect of dilapidated condition of building known as 'Bashiron CHSL' duly signed by Chairman of TAC (Dy. Chief Engineer (Building Proposal) Western Suburbs-I) is attached herewith for further necessary action as per the policy guidelines dated 25.05.2018. (Pg. No. N- to N-)

The original file is returned herewith.

Acc. : 1) Hearing Order
2) Original file

23/06/2021

Chairman,
Technical Advisory Committee
for Private Buildings in Western Suburbs–I
and Dy.Chief Engineer (B.P.) W.S.- I

TAC Member Secretary
Ward Executive Engineer, 'H/West Ward'

Copy to

Asst.Commissioner (H/West)

You are hereby requested to direct your Designated Officer (B&F) H/West Ward to implement the order sanctioned by the Chairman of TAC.

23/06/2021

Dy.Ch.Eng.(BP)WS-I

23/6/21 otc
EE(BP)WSI

F:\Sr.Steno\Note to DO EE reg final Minutes n original file Bashiron CHSL.doc

BRIHANMUMBAI MAHANAGARPALIKA

TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 12.05.2021 AT 11.00 am UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF Dy.CH.E (B.P.) W.S. (chairman, TAC)

No. Dy. Ch. Engr.(B.P)/ /W.S.-I /TAC dt.

Sub :- Structural audit report of the building known as Bashiron CHSL, Plot no.45,28th Road, Bandra west, Mumbai-400050, **H/West ward**.

Ref:- 1) This office has received a structural audit report submitted by the Secretary of Bashiron CHSL dated 15.09.2020.

2) This office intimation letter vide no. ACHW/SR/1979/AEII/FO100/BF dated 19.09.2020.

3) This office has received a another structural audit from Advocate Mr. Ghanshyam Mishra on behalf of Mr. Asgar Ali Sayyed and others dated 03.03.2021.

4) B.C.C.C suit no. 537 of 2021.

5) File forwarded to TAC dated 26.03.2021.

6) TAC site visit and meeting dated 12.05.2021.

The following Officers/Consultants were present for the meeting:-

Sr.	Name of Officers/Consultants	Designation
1.	Shri U.V Mahale	Dy.Ch.E.(B.P.)W.S, Chairman, TAC
2.	Shri V.S Tawde	E.E.(B.P.)W.S. H ward, Member, TAC
3.	Shri. H.V. Javeed	W.E.E.H/W ward, Secretary, TAC
4.	Shri. Naman Karaniya	Assistant Engineer-II (B&F) H/West
5.	Shri Unmesh B. Paranjpe	Structural consltant of Concretech Consulting services

Preamble: - As per record submitted, date of initial inspection by AE/DO: - 10.08.2020

1) Name and Address of the building: - Bashiron CHSL, Plotno.45,28th Road, Bandra west, Mumbai-400050

2) Year of Construction/ Age of the building: - More than 40yrs old.

3) Type of structure:- R.C.C. framed structure

4) Number of Floors:- Stilt + six upper floor

5) Details of Correspondence by User Dept. with TAC:-

Designated Officer H/W ward submitted the file papers on 31.03.2021 for TAC opinion. Accordingly, TAC meeting was arranged on 12.05.2021 at 11.00 am, under the Chairmanship of Dy.Ch.E.(B.P.)W.S-I. and the entire submission by H/West ward were kept before the TAC members.

6) Details of Structural Audit Report (SAR), Proforma 'B' and Technical aspects Received by the User Dept.:-

Sr. No.	Non-destructive tests	M/S. ConcreTech Consulting Services (Consulting Structural Engineer STR/P/130) (On behalf of secretary)	Con Arch India Mr. Asrar A. Jatoo (Consulting Civil and Structural Engineers STR/J/54). (On behalf of secretary)	Range as per I S code
1	Ultrasonic Pulse Velocity Test : IS-13311, Part 1	1.75 Km/sec	0.83km/sec	IS 13311(Part-1), Above 4.5Km/s- Excellent 3.5 to 4.5 Km/s - Good 3.0 to 3.5 Km/s - Medium 2.0 to 3.0 Km/s - Doubtful
2	Rebound Hammer Test IS 13311(Part-2)	Below 10 N/mm sq as 10 N/mm sq	14.58 N/mm sq.	Above 20 N/mm sq is good. Below 20 N/mm sq is bad

3	Half cell potential test:Result summary (ASTM C-876:2015)	-320mV	-310mV	ASTM C-8769:2015 Probability of corrosion being active (Half Cell Potential Reading Range Cu-CuSo4) (a). >95 percent : More negative than -350 mV (b). 50 percent :-200 to -350 mV, (c). <5 percent : More positive than -200 mV
4	Carbonation Depth Test:Results Summary (BS EN 14630:2006)	55mm	Not done	BS EN 14630:2006 There is no reference to the maximum carbonation depth in codes. However; contamination of concrete due to carbonation should not be more than clear cover . As per the codal provision in IS:456:2000, for moderate exposure condition minimum cover should be in this range.
5	Core test	9.8 N/Sqmm (i.e 9.8 mpa)	Not done	Average equivalent cube results as per IS 456-2000 & 516 : 1959

6	Chemical Analysis test PH value/ Acid Soluble chloride/Water soluble sulphate	9.79/0.04/0.30%	Not done	10-13, greater than 0.6kg/cum, 4% permissible limit as per IS 456:2000 table 7 & cl 8.2.5.3
7	Category of building	C-1 category	C-2A category	**C-1** - to be vacate and pull down immediately **C-2A** - eviction and major structural repairs **C-2B** - no eviction need major structural repairs **C-3** – minor repairs only

TAC Conclusion:

As per the Hon'ble court order in B.C.C.C Suit no 537 of 2021which stated that "*as there are conflicting structural audit reports in respect of the suit building, now the matter is required to be referred to the technical Advisory Committee, as per the guidelines laid down by MCGM*".

Accordingly, site has been inspected on 12.05.2021 at 10:00 am by TAC members along with H/west ward staff. Thereafter, TAC meeting was held on 12.05.2021 at 11:00 am, Shri Unmesh B. Paranjpe(Structural consitant of Concretech Consulting services) was present from secretary side. And Mr. Asrar A. Jatoo (Con Arch India Consulting Civil and Structural Engineers STR/J/54) on behalf of tenants was absent In the meeting, Structural audit reports of both the structural consultants were taken into consideration.

During site visit by TAC members and H/West ward staff it is observed that the building comprising stilt + 6upper floor structure having completed approximately more than 40 years of age. TAC members inspected the structure externally and internally. The structural members were also inspected internally and externally on each floor by TAC members. The observations of the site visit were discussed in the meeting in detail.

Mr.Unmesh B. Paranjpe (M/S. ConcreTech Consulting Services (Consulting Structural Engineer STR/P/130) from Secretary side stated that they have carried out all the necessary tests. He further stated that cracks were developed everywhere, test results are of doubtfull level and the overall condition of the building is very bad. The building is beyond repair and should be categorized

in C1 category i.e. to be vacate and pull down.

As per the Structural Audit Report of Mr. Asrar A. Jatoo (Con Arch India Consulting Civil and Structural Engineers STR/J/54) from tenants side they have carried out necessary tests. The Structural consultant has also submitted a Proforma-B in which the building under reference is classified in C-2A category i.e To be be evacuated and / or partial demolition requiring major structure repairs). All the TAC members have carefully gone through the structural audit reports submitted by the consultants and had discussion on the recommendations and conclusions as seen in the table above.

The structural audit reports, proforma B and facts put up by all the structural consultants, opinions/reports of ward staff were discussed during meeting in detail. After going through both the structural audit reports submitted by the structural consultants, opinion/reports of the ward staff and observations made during the site visit by TAC members on 12.05.2021. TAC opinion that the building needs to be vacate and pull down immediately.

TAC Order:-

In view of the above, it is unanimously declared that the building known as Bashiron CHSL, Plot no.45,28th Road, Bandra west, Mumbai-400050, H West Ward falls in **C-1 category i.e needs to be vacated and pull down immediately**. Designated Officeer H/West should take action as per the policy guidelines dated 25.05.2018. In case of any untoward incident resulting to loss of life and property, M.C.G.M will not be held responsible.

In the meanwhile, safety precautionary measures i.e propping etc. wherever required shall be taken with utmost care to avoid any untoward incident.

14/6/21

(Shri. Gajanan O. Giri)
Asstt. Law Officer H/W
(Member, TAC)

14/6/21

(Shri V.S Tawde)
Ex.Engr (B.P.) W.S. H ward
(Member, TAC)

09/06/2021

(Shri. H.V. Javeed)
Ward Ex. Engr H/W ward
(Secretary, TAC)

21/06/2021

(Shri U.V. Mahale)
Dy.Ch.E. (B.P.) W.S.
Chairman TAC