BRIHANMUMBAI MUNICIPAL CORPORATION

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE (2025-28)

MINUTES OF THE **SEVENTH** MEETING

Date: Wednesday, 22.07.2025.

Time: 11.00 AM to 01:30 PM

The following Committee members were present:

• Shri. Praveen Pardeshi	Chairman.
• Prof Rajiv Mishra	Principal, Sir J J College of Architecture
• Ar. Chetan Akre	Chief Architect, PWD - GoM
• Shri Sudhakar Nangnure	Ex. Director of Town Planning.
• Dr. P.P. Bhave	Environmental Expert.
• Dr. Shashank Mehendale	Structural Engineer.
• Architect Rahul Chemburkar	Conservation Architect.

The following officers were in attendance:

• Smt Aparna Bhatte	Municipal Architect
• Shri Vitthal Jadhav	Sr. Architect (D.P.)
• Smt Ashlesha Modak	Sr. Architect (D.P.)
• Shri Rituraj Karanjkar	Sub-Eng. (Architect) D.P

Leave of absence was granted to Prof. A. A. Bage, Dr. Sabyasachi Mukherjee, Prof K.K. Sangle, Dr. Manjiri Kamat members of the Committee, who were unable to attend the meeting owing to preoccupations.

Minutes of the previous MHCC meeting dated 26.06.2025 (06th) were confirmed and the office was instructed to get the final copy of minutes signed by the Chairman.

The Committee noted that Smt. Aparna Bhatte, Municipal Architect, is due to retire from municipal service on 31st July 2025. Over the years, Smt. Bhatte has played an important role in the functioning of the MHCC, contributing significantly to the Committee's deliberations on both heritage-related proposals and broader administrative matters. Her deep understanding of heritage regulations, institutional processes, and past precedents has been of considerable value to the Committee. In view of her long association with the MHCC and the institutional knowledge she brings, the Committee resolved to co-opt Smt. Aparna Bhatte as a member of the MHCC following her retirement. Her role as a co-opted member shall be honorary, without

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

any reimbursement or honorarium, until formal administrative approval for her inclusion is obtained from the BMC. The Committee expressed its appreciation for her past contributions and looks forward to her continued guidance in heritage conservation matters.

A. <u>The following proposals were considered:</u>

<u>01. Review of draft heritage guidelines for development work in the 'Fort Precinct'.</u>

The sub-committee presented its report regarding the review of draft heritage guidelines for development in the Fort Precinct, specifically in connection with the proposed reconstruction of the building on Plot C.S. No. 409 of Fort Division, located at Cawasji Patel Street, Fort, Mumbai. The Committee deliberated on the matter in detail and, after considering all relevant aspects, approved the report and recommendations submitted by the sub-committee.
Accordingly, the proposal for reconstruction on the above plot was considered in today's meeting. Based on the sub-committee's recommendations, the MHCC examined the proposal with reference to the allowable height and architectural design, within the context of the heritage precinct. The Committee took into account the site-specific planning constraints presented by the applicant, and comparable developments in the vicinity, including the High Court-sanctioned case of Shreeji Realty. It was also noted that B.P. dept. has granted IOD on 10.12.2021 for the said redevelopment proposal contemplating construction of basement + ground + 18 upper storied building with the height of 69.90M up to terrace level.
In consideration of the above and in accordance with Clause 3(vi) of the draft guidelines, the MHCC decided to recommend a relaxation of height restrictions to permit development up to 70 meters for this particular site and approved the design of the proposed building from a heritage perspective subject to the general conditions of the MHCC.

<u>02. Sr. No.: Nil</u> **<u>Grade – Precinct</u>**

<u>'Marine Drive Precinct'</u>

Proposal: - Proposed new 'Mantralaya Building for Cabinet Ministers' Chambers and offices, opposite Main Mantralaya Building on plot bearing CTS. No. 1580 to 1590 and 1577 to 1586 of Fort Division in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Architect G M Arch / Chief Eng. PWD.

Ref: - i) Application u/no. CHE/6399/DP-DyMA dated 17.06.2025;

The site u/r is part of the existing Mantralaya campus, which is situated in the notified Marine Drive Heritage Precinct.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

Proposal: - In this case it was informed that the office of Chief Engineer PWD have appointed Architect G M Arch for the said proposal and the following was informed:

1) The Hon'ble Chief Minister Maharashtra has sought enhancement of and increase in the capacity of the present Mantralaya building as the existing space is insufficient to accommodate offices of all cabinet ministers.
2) The Hon'ble Chief Minister accorded approval on 07.01.2025 for the construction of a new building within Mantralaya Complex.
3) Accordingly the proposal has been put up for construction of ground + 5 storey (23.95 M up to the terrace level) new Mantralaya building for cabinet minister's chambers and offices within the open space available in the Mantralaya campus.
4) It has been informed that the said proposal has been approved by Municipal Commissioner vide note sheet dated 21.03.2025.

Discussion in today's meeting: - The said proposal was presented jointly by the Consulting Architect, Superintending Engineer (PWD), and Chief Architect (PWD). The following issues and points were put forth to justify the proposal:

1. Insufficient Space in Existing Building

The current Mantralaya structure is unable to accommodate all ministers, officers, and administrative staff. Essential departments are functioning from scattered locations, which disrupts coordination and affects efficiency.

2. Dispersed Offices Hamper Administrative Coordination

Departments located outside the main campus (at GT Hospital complex, New Administrative Building, etc.) face frequent delays in decision-making due to physical separation from ministers and key administrative wings.

3. Loss of Productive Time and Public Resources

Time is lost in routine file movement, meetings, and inter-departmental communication because of the need to travel between multiple buildings. Daily travel between Mantralaya and other office locations results in increased fuel consumption, use of official vehicles, and manpower—leading to unnecessary expenditure of public funds.

5. Security Concerns

Handling sensitive documents and communications across various locations increases the risk of security breaches. A centralized administrative block ensures better control and security.

6. Public Inconvenience

Citizens and representatives visiting for official work face difficulty locating the correct departments. A single, well-planned administrative complex would streamline public access and improve service delivery.

8. Emergency Response and Crisis Management

MAHARASHTRA HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

During emergencies (e.g. natural disasters, law and order situations), fragmented offices slow down coordination. A centralized setup ensures quicker and more cohesive responses.

9. Optimal Use of Government Land

Expanding vertically within the existing Mantralaya premises utilizes prime government land more effectively than continuing reliance on rented or distant spaces.

10. Long-Term Cost Saving

Consolidation of offices within one modern complex will reduce long-term recurring costs on rent, transport, logistics, and maintenance of multiple buildings.

It was informed by the applicant that approval from BMC B.P. dept. / Municipal Commissioner has been obtained for the ground + 5 storey building with the height of 24M. However, to meet the actual spatial requirements, an additional two floors are necessary, taking the total height of the building to 32 metres. This is comparable to the existing Mantralaya building, which stands at 34 metres. The Committee was therefore requested to consider and approve the additional height of two floors (up to 32 metres) in order to ensure optimal use of space and to accommodate all administrative functions within the campus.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was discussed at length by the Committee. All earlier discussions, relevant guidelines issued by the Urban Development Department, and legal aspects were duly considered. The Committee, at the outset, acknowledged that Mantralaya is the administrative seat of governance for the State of Maharashtra, and that developing a modern and efficiently planned administrative complex reflects the State's commitment to streamlined governance and effective public service delivery. The points submitted by the applicant were carefully examined. The Committee found merit in the justification provided for the construction of a new building and agreed on the need to centralize government functions for administrative efficiency. It was observed that the Mantralaya Complex should be allowed to utilize its maximum permissible global FSI to ensure optimal use of prime government land and reduce ongoing public expenditure arising from scattered operations.

In view of this, the Chief Architect, PWD and Superintending Engineer, PWD were advised to conduct a detailed survey and prepare a comprehensive report on the existing and required spatial provisions within the Mantralaya campus for all departments. It was further recommended that they visit the Chandigarh Capitol Complex, designed by architect Le Corbusier, as a case study for efficient institutional planning and functional design.

After due consideration of all relevant aspects, the Committee decided to grant it's NOC from the heritage point of view for the proposed new building within the Mantralaya campus, as approved by the Municipal Commissioner. It was recommended that additional two floors i.e. total height up to 32 metres may be considered by the planning authority in this case, being

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

consistent with the height pattern of existing structures in the complex, subject to compliance of the prevailing guidelines and legal directions. The approval would be subject to the following conditions:

1) that, structural stability of the proposed building shall be ensured under the guidance of a certified structural consultant. There must be no compromise on fire safety and building safety provisions;
2) that, the building / campus shall include a Sewage Treatment Plant (STP) to maximize the reuse of treated sewage. The energy-efficient and environment-friendly Sewage treatment alternatives, such as Soil Biotechnology (SBT) or Phytorid technology type, need to be explored. A dedicated plumbing system shall be provided for the use of treated water for flushing, gardening, and other non-potable uses. No municipal water supply shall be used for these purposes;
3) that, rooftop solar panels shall be installed to supplement the building's electricity requirement and reduce dependency on conventional power sources;
4) that, proposed new building be designed and executed as a Green Building, adhering to established environmental standards such as GRIHA (Green Rating for Integrated Habitat Assessment) or IGBC (Indian Green Building Council) norms to promote environmental sustainability and long-term energy efficiency;
5) that, the project is encouraged to utilize open spaces for indigenous landscaping, including the promotion of Miyawaki plantation or similar methods to enhance biodiversity and improve the microclimate,
6) that, this NOC is issued only from heritage point of view and authenticity/approvability of the proposal, including ownership, permissible F.S.I., open spaces / setback, parking, amalgamation of plots etc. being subsequently examined and got approved from the concerned B.P. Dept. as per the provisions of prevailing DCPR, guidelines and policies in force. All other applicable permissions from concerned dept. shall be obtained before starting the work at site.
7) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained;
8) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;
9) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site u/r

To ensure effective internal space planning, circulation, departmental zoning, connectivity with existing structures, and an architectural character suitable for an institutional seat of governance, it was decided that the planning of the existing Mantralaya building would be reviewed by the PWD dept. Sir J. J. College of Architecture is to be appointed for this purpose,

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

so that the design of the proposed new building can be improved accordingly. The Chief Architect, PWD, has been directed to submit the report at the earliest.

03. Sr. No.: 91 & 92 **Grade II-A**

'Royal Bombay Yacht Club'

Proposal: - Proposed construction of wooden staircase from 4th to 5th floor at Royal Bombay Yacht Club, Mumbai.

Applicant: - M/s Deole Bros, L.S.

Ref: - i) Application u/no CHE/5700/DP-DyMA dated 09.076.2025;

The building of Royal Bombay Yacht Club is listed at Sr. No. 91 & 92 under Grade II-A and also part of Gateway Precinct of Fort Precinct as per the notified heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - The existing *Royal Bombay Yacht Club* building is a Ground + 4 storied structure with an additional attic floor. Currently, the attic is accessed through a narrow spiral iron staircase from the 4th floor, which is inadequate for regular use. The present proposal involves the construction of a new wooden staircase connecting the 4th to the attic (5th floor) by removing a portion of the existing attic slab.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by the architect during the meeting. It was informed that the new staircase is designed to complement the existing architectural character and interior finishes of the original heritage structure. It was also confirmed that the structural stability of the proposed intervention has been examined and verified by a structural consultant. After detailed discussion, the Committee found the scope of work approvable from the heritage point of view and decided to grant its NOC for the proposal, subject to the following conditions:

i) that, the structural stability of the building shall be ensured under the guidance and certification of a qualified structural consultant;

ii) that, all original architectural features and heritage elements of the building shall be preserved and/or restored in their authentic form.

iii) that, all work shall be executed in accordance with conservation norms, under the supervision of a conservation architect or expert;

iv) that, this approval is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions shall be obtained from concerned authorities before execution of work.

v) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained;

vi) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

vii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work.

04. Sr. No.:39 **Grade: II-A**

'Commissioner of Police Office (Police Headquarters)'

Proposal: - Proposed restoration of façade, addition of toilet on second floor and interior of first floor corridors & offices in the C.P. office building in Fort, Mumbai.

Architect: - M/s. Sankraman Design Studio.

Reference: - i) CHE/58589/DP-DyMA dated 09.07.2025.

The building u/r is listed at Sr. No. 39 under the name 'Police Headquarters' as a Grade II-A structure in the heritage list. The building u/r reflects Neo-Gothic architectural style which is prominently seen in the Fort area.

Proposal: - The proposal involves the restoration and upgradation of the C.P. Office Building, including façade conservation, addition of a toilet on the second floor, and interior renovation of first floor corridors and offices. The detailed scope of work is as follows:

External Works:

1. Clearing of biological growth (plants, moss, etc.) and cleaning of stone surfaces using appropriate methods to preserve material integrity.
2. Repointing with compatible lime mortar to ensure breathability and appropriate finish.
3. Application of antifungal treatment to façade surfaces to prevent microbial growth.
4. Dismantling of existing weather sheds and replacement with clay tiles supported on treated wooden members.
5. Replacement of damaged wooden plank ceilings with new, treated wooden planks of matching dimensions and finish.
6. Installation of Mangalore tiles over proper under-structure ensuring correct alignment, overlap, and waterproofing.

Internal Works:

1. Removal of damaged plaster and re-plastering with breathable lime putty in multiple coats, followed by paint suited to heritage interiors.
2. Repair and polishing of existing wooden doors and windows, with refurbished or new brass hardware.
3. Installation of wooden/composite wall panelling for office cabins, lightweight partitions, and custom-made interior furniture.
4. Laying of Minton tiles with appropriate surface preparation and finish.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

5. Full renovation or installation of toilets including plumbing, sanitary fixtures, finishes, and fittings as per proposed design.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented in detail by the project architect. The Committee reviewed the scope and methodology and found it approvable from the heritage point of view, considering that the proposed interventions follow appropriate conservation practices and respect the character of the structure. After due consideration, the Committee decided to grant its approval from the heritage point of view for the said proposal subject to the following conditions:

i) that, the structural stability of the building shall be ensured under the guidance and certification of a qualified structural consultant;
ii) that, all original architectural features and heritage elements of the building shall be preserved and/or restored in their authentic form.
iii) that, all work shall be executed in accordance with conservation norms, under the supervision of a conservation architect or expert;
iv) that, possibility of designing plumbing lines for the new toilet from inside the structure shall be explored to maintain the aesthetics of the building façade;
v) that, this approval is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions shall be obtained from concerned authorities before execution of work.
vi) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained;
vii) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;
viii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work.

05. Sr. No.: 180 **Grade II-B**

'Bombay Gymkhana'

Proposal: - Proposed installation of low height glass partitions near the Pavilion area on the first floor of the Bombay Gymkhana building in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Architect Aparna Garud.

Ref: - i) Applications u/r CHE/5550/DyMA dated 06.07.2025.

The site u/r of 'Bombay Gymkhana' is listed at Sr. No. 180 under Grade II-B in the heritage list of 'A' Ward.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

Scope of Work: - The proposal involves the installation of a low-height clear glass partition measuring 2.20 metres, with matching glass doors, to separate the lobby and pavilion areas on the first floor of the main building.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by the architect. After due consideration of all aspects, the Committee found the proposed works approvable from heritage point of view and it was decided to grant approval from heritage point of view subject to the following conditions:

i) that, the structural stability of the glass partition, fittings, and surrounding structure shall be ensured under the guidance and certification of a qualified structural consultant;
ii) that, all original architectural features and heritage elements of the building shall be preserved and/or restored in their authentic form;
iii) that, all work shall be executed in accordance with conservation norms, under the supervision of a conservation architect or expert;
iv) that, this approval is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions shall be obtained from concerned authorities before execution of work;
v) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained;
vi) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;
vii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work.

06. Sr. No.:431 **Grade: II-B**

'Royal Western India Turf Club'

Proposal: - Proposed reconstruction of existing structures at Royal Western Turf Club, situated at plot bearing C.S. No. 47(pt) of Lower Parel Div. in G/S Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - M/s. Aakar Architects and Consultants.

Reference: - i) CHE/5407/DP-DyMA dated 05.06.2025.

The site of Royal Western India Turf Club is listed at Sr. No. 431 under Grade II-B in the sanctioned heritage list of G/S Ward.

Proposal: - The proposal pertains to the demolition of existing redundant/dilapidated structures situated on Sub-Plot 'F' of Plot bearing C.S. No. 47 (pt) of Lower Parel Division, and the construction of two new buildings - a Banquet Hall and a Club House - on the same site.
It was informed that the existing structures on the site primarily consist of ancillary constructions such as sheds, storage rooms, ticket booths, temporary stands, etc., which were

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

erected for operational purposes and do not possess any architectural or heritage value. These structures are now in poor condition, no longer serve any functional requirement, and are proposed to be demolished.

In this regard, in-principle approval from the Hon'ble Municipal Commissioner has already been obtained for the demolition of the existing structures and for the construction of two new buildings namely the Club House and Banquet Hall. Subsequently, the building plans were approved, and the Intimation of Disapproval (IOD) has been granted by the B.P. Dept. on 27.06.2025.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented in detail by the project architect along with representatives from RWITC. It was clarified that the existing structures proposed for demolition are ancillary in nature, built for temporary operational use, and do not possess any architectural or heritage value. It was also stated that consolidating the activities into fewer buildings would help create more open space on site.

The Committee stressed the importance of maximizing open areas by grouping activities into a limited number of buildings. After reviewing the proposal, the Committee concluded that the demolition of the identified structures could be permitted, as it would enable a more space-efficient redevelopment and allow for better-planned open spaces.

In view of the above, and after due consideration of all relevant aspects, the Committee decided to grant its NOC from the heritage perspective for the proposed demolition and construction of the new Banquet Hall and Club House structures, subject to the following conditions:

i) that, structural stability of the proposed building shall be ensured under the guidance of a certified structural consultant. There must be no compromise on fire safety and building safety provisions;

ii) that, the building / campus shall include a Sewage Treatment Plant (STP), preferably Soil Biotechnology (SBT) or Phytorid technology type. A dedicated plumbing system shall be provided for the use of treated water for flushing, gardening, and other non-potable uses. No municipal water supply shall be used for these purposes;

iii) that, rooftop solar panels shall be installed to supplement the building's electricity requirement and reduce dependency on conventional power sources;

iv) that, proposed new building be designed and executed as a Green Building, adhering to established environmental standards such as GRIHA (Green Rating for Integrated Habitat Assessment) or IGBC (Indian Green Building Council) norms to promote environmental sustainability and long-term energy efficiency;

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

v) that, the project is encouraged to utilize the open spaces for indigenous landscaping, including the promotion of Miyawaki plantation or similar methods to enhance biodiversity and improve the microclimate;

vi) that, this NOC is issued only from heritage point of view and authenticity/approvability of the proposal, including ownership, permissible F.S.I., open spaces / setback, parking, etc. being subsequently examined and got approved from the concerned B.P. Dept. as per the provisions of prevailing DCPR, guidelines and policies in force. All other applicable permissions from concerned dept. shall be obtained before starting the work at site.

vii) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained;

viii) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;

ix) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site u/r.

07. Sr. No.: Nil **Grade – Precinct**

'Marine Drive Precinct'

Proposal: - Proposed installation of new design Bus Queue Shelters at 3 locations in Marine Drive.

Applicant: - M/s Signpost India for BEST.

Ref: - i) Application u/no CHE/8951/DP-DyMA dated 08.07.2025.

The locations of the proposed bus stops in situated within the Notified marine Drive Precinct. This case was previously considered by the MHCC in its meeting held on 16.01.2025; where in the MHCC had suggested certain changes in the design to suit the aesthetics of the heritage precinct.

Proposal: - The MHCC had earlier approved a Bus Queue Shelter (BQS) of a new design near the Mafatlal Swimming Pool. The current proposal seeks permission for installation of three additional BQS units of the same approved design, intended to replace existing BQS structures at the following locations:

1) Cricket Club of India
2) Govt. Law College
3) Marine Drive.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by representatives of Signpost India Ltd. It was clarified that the scope of work is limited to the

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

refurbishment of existing BQS structures, and that the revised design complies with BEST standards. It was also noted that the revenue from advertising displays is shared with BEST, contributing to public service operations. After evaluating the revised design, and taking into account its functional and financial benefit to BEST, the Committee decided to grant its NOC from the heritage point of view for the proposal, subject to the following conditions:

i) that, structural stability of the refurbished bus shelter shall be ensured;

ii) that, all terms and conditions stipulated by BEST and BMC shall be strictly followed;

iii) that, size of bus shelters / display panels shall not exceed the existing size of bus shelters and to be verified and as approved by BEST;

iv) that, this approval is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;

v) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained on completion of work at site u/r.

08. Sr. No.:121 **Grade – I and Precinct**

'Palm Court'

Proposal: - Proposed repairs to flat no. 16 at 6th floor, Palm Court, Opp Oval Maidan, Fort, Mumbai.

Applicant: - M/s Hormasji Ardeshir & Co.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/7013/DP-DyMA dated 24.06.2025;

The building u/r known as Palm Court is part of the heritage buffer of Grade-I site of Oval maidan and also situated within Oval Maidan Heritage Precinct.

Proposal: - It was informed that tenantable repairs are ongoing in the premises under reference. A majority of the windows in the building have already been replaced with aluminium section windows, while only two windows remain in wooden material. These wooden windows are now in a severely decayed state and beyond repair.

The applicant has sought MHCC approval for replacing the decayed wooden windows with heavy-section, openable, double-glazed aluminium windows to maintain aesthetic uniformity within the premises.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The architect presented the proposal, clarifying the following:

- The building is not individually listed but lies within a designated precinct and falls under the Grade-I buffer zone.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

- The sixth floor, where the subject premises are located, was a later addition to the original structure.
- Most windows in the building have already been changed to aluminium sections.
- The two remaining wooden windows are deteriorated and beyond salvage.
- The proposed replacement aims to match the existing aluminium windows in design and proportion to ensure uniformity.

After considering all aspects, the Committee approved the proposal for replacement of the windows, subject to the following conditions:

i) that, structural stability of the building shall be ensured under the guidance and certification of a qualified structural consultant.

ii) that, original architectural features and elements of the building shall be preserved. The original grid of openings and external elements of the building façade shall be maintained.

iii) that, maintaining the overall uniformity of the building façade is important and window designs are an integral feature. Therefore, whenever a comprehensive façade restoration is undertaken, all windows should be designed to match the original design.

iv) that, box grills should not be used for the windows and A.C should not be fixed on the front façade.

v) that, this NOC is issued only from the heritage point of view. All other necessary permissions from the planning authority and relevant departments must be obtained prior to commencement of work.

vi) that, any subsequent changes to the proposal will require a revised NOC from the MHCC.

vii) that, this NOC is valid for a period of two years from the date of issuance.

viii) that, Completion Certificate from the MHCC shall be obtained upon completion of the work at the site under reference.

09. Sr. No.:121 **Grade – I and Precinct**

'CSMT GM Building'

Proposal: - Proposed restoration of facades of CSMT G.M. building situated at Fort in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - M/s Nandapurkar & Associates.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/6857/DP-DyMA dated 23.06.2025;

The 'Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Terminus' building, designed by the British architect F. W. Stevens, is an outstanding example of Victorian Gothic Revival Architecture in India blended

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

with themes deriving from Indian traditional architecture. CSMT main building is a Grade-I structure listed at Sr. No. 121 in the heritage list and also part of 'Fort Precinct' and also an UNESCO World heritage site.

Proposal: - The proposal for external restoration of the facades of the CSMT G.M. building was earlier placed before the MHCC in its meeting held on 17.04.2025. Following that, a site visit was conducted by MHCC members on 25.04.2025. Based on the visit, certain suggestions were given, and the applicant was advised to have the final drawings vetted by Prof. Rajiv Mishra, Principal, Sir J.J. College of Architecture. The applicant has now submitted the final drawings duly approved by Prof. Mishra, along with methodology and material specifications, for consideration of final approval.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The Committee examined the final drawings and accompanying documents. It found the proposal approvable from a heritage conservation perspective. The MHCC decided to grant its *approval* for the external restoration of the facades of the CSMT G.M. building, subject to the following conditions:

i) that, the structural stability of the building shall be ensured under the guidance and certification of a qualified structural consultant;
ii) that, all original architectural features and heritage elements of the building shall be preserved and/or restored in their authentic form;
iii) that, all work shall be executed in accordance with conservation norms, under the supervision of a conservation architect or expert;
iv) that, all norms and guidelines for the conservation of the World Heritage Site shall be followed under the guidance of the Conservation Architect;
v) that, this approval is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions shall be obtained from concerned authorities before execution of work.
vi) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained;
vii) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;
viii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work.

10. Sr. No.:295/2 **Grade II-A**

'Magen David Synagogue'

Proposal: - Proposed repairs / restoration of building known as 'Megen David Synagogue' situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 246 of Byculla Division, Nagpada, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Architect Patidar Alliance.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/7085/DP-DyMA dated 24.06.2025;

The site u/r of 'Megen David Synagogue' is listed at Sr. No. 295/2 under Grde II-A in the heritage list of 2012.

Proposal: - The proposal pertains to the repairs and restoration of the Synagogue structure. However, the applicant informed the Committee that a portion of the structure has already collapsed. At present, permission is being sought from the MHCC for propping the collapsed portion in order to safeguard the remaining structure.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The meeting was attended by the architect and representative from the Ward Office and the proposal was explained in detail. Considering the urgency and the need to prevent further deterioration, the Committee agreed to grant permission for propping of the collapsed portion of the Synagogue structure purely as a temporary safety measure. It was recommended that such interventions shall be strictly reversible and temporary in nature. The Committee also directed the applicant to submit a detailed restoration proposal through a conservation architect at the earliest for further consideration.

11. Sr. No.:295/2 **Grade II-A**

'Taraporewala Mansion'

Proposal: - Proposed restoration of external facades and internal additions / alterations and regularization of second floor at Taraporewala Mansion in Cuffe Parade, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Architect Vaastu Vidhaan Projects.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/9395/DP-DyMA dated 17.07.2025;
ii) MHCC NOC dated 30.06.2023.

The existing original front part of 'Taraporewalla Mansion' is collectively listed at Sr. No. 96 under Grade II-B, along with other building of same period.

Proposal: - In this case, the MHCC had earlier granted its approval for the restoration of external facades, internal additions/alterations, and regularization of the second floor at Taraporewala Mansion vide letter dated 30.06.2023. The applicant has now informed that no work has commenced at the site, and the two-year validity period of the approval has lapsed. Accordingly, revalidation of the MHCC's NOC is now being sought.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The Committee noted the request and decided to revalidate the earlier NOC dated 30.06.2023 for a further period of two years, subject to the same terms and conditions as mentioned in the original approval.

12. Sr. No.: 188 /236 **Grade - III**

'Bhadran Bhuvan / Villa Rashmi'

Proposal: - Regarding structure known as 'Villa Rashmi' situated at CTS No. 189 of Village Malad East affected by road widening of 13.40M wide sanctioned R.L. of Manchubhai Road, Malad (E), Mumbai.

Applicant: - Assistant Commissioner P/N Ward.

Ref: - i) Application u/no CHE/5598/DP-DyMA dated 06.06.2025;

ii) Representation from the owner dated 05.05.2025;

iii) MHCC Meeting dated

The building u/r known as Bhadran Bhuvan / Villa Rashmi is included at Sr. No 188/236 under Grade – III in the heritage list of 2012.

Proposal: - It has been informed that the office of Assistant Commissioner P/N Ward have undertaken widening of 13.40M sanctioned R.L. of Manchubhai Road, Malad (E). In this case, the following has been stated by the applicant:

1) The structure known as Villa Rashmi is partially affected by the sanctioned R.L and accordingly the applicant has issued notice u/s 299 of MMC Act to the owner of the property to acquire an open set back along with compound wall / fence of the said property.
2) The widening of the road will help cater traffic congestion and provide relief to large number of residents.

In the same case, the owner of the building Shri Haresh Patel has also submitted a representation to the MHCC against the notice from the Ward office.

Discussion of the MHCC in earlier meeting: - The case was explained by the officials from the Ward office. The Committee was informed that the widening of the said road is essential from the traffic movement point of view and the widening doesn't affect the structure of Villa Rashmi; however it only includes the compound wall and building setback. The Committee also noted the representation from the owner of the building – Mr. Haresh Patel and points mentioned therein. After due consideration the Committee in-principle, was in favour of allowing acquisition of the open space for the road widening as the Villa structure is not affected in any way. However, as per the application of the owner, it was decided to request owner to

HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

attend the next meeting of the MHCC and present their case before taking final decision in this regard.

Discussion of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The applicant was requested to attend today's meeting to represent the case. However, the Committee was informed that the applicant could not attend due to being out of station. The Committee decided to give one more opportunity to the applicant to present their case in person. The decision on the matter was therefore deferred until the next meeting.

B. The following proposals for Completion Certificate were considered:

01. Sr. No.: 144/80 **Grade II-B**

'Our lady of Health, Versova'

Proposal: - Repairs to the roof and other miscellaneous works to the existing old church building known as Our Lady of Health Church situated at CTS No. 1268, Village Versova at K/W Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Architect Shirish Sukhatme.

Ref: - i) Application u/no. CHE/9121/DP-DyMA dated 15.06.2025;
ii) MHCC NOC dated 09.01.2024.

The site u/r of 'Our Lady of Health' is listed at Sr. No. 144/80 under Grade II-B in the heritage list of 2012.

Proposal: - In this case, the MHCC had granted its approval for repairs to the roof and other miscellaneous works to the existing old church building known as Our Lady of Health Church vide letter dated 09.01.2024. The applicant has now informed that the said work has been completed at site and the Completion Certificate of the MHCC has been sought.

Discussion of the Committee meeting dated 25.10.2023: - The proposal was explained by the architect. The architect presented the details of the completed works to the Committee. After examining the submissions and site condition, the Committee found that the work has been carried out in accordance with the terms of the NOC and is acceptable from a heritage point of view. The Committee decided to grant the *Completion Certificate* for the said works purely from the heritage conservation perspective.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

B. <u>The following subjects were discussed</u>

<u>1. Policy / Guidelines for hoardings / signage and street furniture in the heritage listed sites and precinct.</u>

The Heritage Committee was directed to prepare a policy and guidelines for the heritage-sensitive display of hoardings, signage, and street furniture within heritage listed sites and precincts. The Committee reviewed the earlier draft guidelines prepared in 2013 and recommended updates to align them with current regulatory frameworks and contemporary urban conditions. Conservation Architect Rahul Chemburkar was requested to revise and finalize the guidelines accordingly and submit the final draft for the approval of the Committee and the Municipal Commissioner.

In continuation of this discussion, the Committee took up the specific case of signage at Minara Masjid. The matter was discussed in the presence of officials from the License Department of 'B' Ward and the owner of the concerned commercial premises. The License Department informed the Committee that, based on a complaint, the license issued for the signage in question had been withdrawn. The owner had accordingly been advised to obtain a heritage No Objection Certificate (NOC) from the MHCC before proceeding further.

The owner explained that the size and projection of the signage had already been reduced in accordance with directions from the License Department. After reviewing the revised signage and in line with the Committee's ongoing discussions on signage policy, the MHCC decided to permit signboards not exceeding a height of 60 cm and spanning the full width of the respective premises. However, given that the property is a multi-tenanted commercial arcade, the Committee emphasized the need for visual coherence in all signage across the façade. It was therefore recommended that all signage along the Minara Masjid frontage be standardized in terms of font size, colour palette, and placement.

The Committee directed the License Department and the owner/trustees of the premises to coordinate and streamline all signage in a consistent, heritage-sensitive format that respects the architectural character of the building. A consolidated signage proposal incorporating these recommendations is to be submitted to the MHCC for review and formal approval.

<u>2. Letter from Under Secretary, Urban Development Dept. regarding listing of 'Savarkar Sadan' in the heritage list, situated at Shivaji Park, Mumbai.</u>

This is with reference to the letter dated 16.07.2025, received from the Under Secretary, Urban Development Department, Government of Maharashtra, regarding the proposal for inclusion of 'Savarkar Sadan', located at Shivaji Park, Mumbai, in the heritage list. The U.D. dept. therein has directed to convene a meeting of the MHCC and invite applicant to attend the meeting

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

along with the all necessary documents / information to represent their case on which the MHCC can offer the remarks on merit.

In response, the applicant Prof. Dr. Pankaj K. Phadnis, Founding President and Authorized Representative of Abhinav Bharat Congress was invited to attend the meeting of the Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee (MHCC) held today. However, the applicant conveyed that he is unable to participate in any such meeting unless specifically directed to do so by the Hon'ble High Court, which is presently seized of the matter. It was also submitted by the applicant that as per the order dated 09.05.2025 passed by the Hon'ble Bombay High Court in the ongoing proceedings, the following direction has been issued: "Till the returnable date, the status of the said property shall not be changed and the position as prevailing today shall be maintained."

In light of the above, the matter was placed before the Committee for consideration in the absence of the applicant. The meeting was also attended by Smt. Vandana Mahadik, Deputy Law Officer, Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai. The Committee took note of the above-mentioned communication from the Urban Development Department, the previous recommendations and correspondence of the MHCC in this regard, and the aforesaid order of the Hon'ble High Court.

It was noted that the case had been previously considered by the MHCC in the year 2009. Given the passage of approximately 15 years, the Committee found it appropriate to undertake a fresh review of the matter in the context of the current heritage framework.

Pursuant to the directions of the Hon'ble High Court, the Committee confined its review to a heritage-related evaluation and resolved to offer its observations accordingly, as sought in the letter from the Urban Development Department. It is understood that the final decision on the grading of the said property lies within the domain of the Urban Development Department. The Committee further recorded that the status of the property shall remain unchanged until final orders are passed by the Hon'ble High Court.

Upon review of the present condition of the premises, the Committee noted that the structure, known as 'Savarkar Sadan', was constructed in 1938 by Shri Vinayak Damodar Savarkar and served as his residence until his demise in 1966. The Committee observed that while the structure does not possess distinctive architectural or aesthetic merit to qualify independently as a heritage building, it is historically significant owing to its direct association with Shri Savarkar and, in particular, to the period of his residence and the act of Atmaarpan (self-declared fast) undertaken therein. It was also opined by the Committee that the information plaque and the Museum space at the present location needs to be maintained.

After due deliberation, the Committee was of the considered view that, despite the absence of exceptional architectural features, the premises holds substantial historical significance and

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

intangible heritage value on account of its direct association with Shri Vinayak Damodar Savarkar. In view thereof, the Committee recommended that the property may be considered for inclusion in the heritage list under Grade III.

3. Installation of the lift at front façade of the Esplanade Court building

This matter was discussed as an additional item with the permission of the Chairman; in presence of Superintending Engineer PWD and Chief Architect PWD. The Committee expressed strong displeasure over the fact that the lift work on the front façade of the building was being carried out without obtaining prior approval from the MHCC, which is mandatory for any interventions within a notified heritage buildings.

The MHCC reiterated its clear recommendation that any lift installation should be planned either within the interior of the building or at the rear side, in order to maintain the visual integrity and aesthetic appropriateness of the heritage campus.

The said recommendation of the MHCC was accepted and agreed to by the Chief Architect, PWD and Superintending Engineer, PWD, who assured that the matter would be reviewed and necessary corrective steps taken accordingly.

Chairman
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee