BRIHANMUMBAI MUNICIPAL CORPORATION

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE (2025-28)

MINUTES OF THE SECOND MEETING

Date: Thursday, 17.04.2025.

Time: 03.00 PM to 05:30 PM

The following Committee members were present:

- Shri. Praveen Pardeshi — Chairman.
- Prof Rajiv Mishra — Principal, Sir J.J. College of Architecture
- Prof. A. A. Bage — HOD Dept of Structural Eng., SP College.
- Shri Sudhakar Nangnure — Ex. Director of Town Planning.
- Dr. P.P. Bhave — Environmental Expert.
- Dr. Shashank Mehendale — Structural Engineer

The following officers were in attendance:

- Smt Aparna Bhatte — Dy. Mun. Architect (D.P.)
- Shri Vitthal Jadhav — Sr. Architect (D.P.)
- Smt Ashlesha Modak — Sr. Architect (D.P.)
- Shri Rituraj Karanjkar — Sub-Eng. (Architect) D.P

Leave of absence was granted to Dr. Sabyasachi Mukherjee, Ar. Chetan Akre, Prof K.K. Sangle, members of the Committee, who were unable to attend the meeting owing to preoccupations.

Minutes of the previous MHCC meeting dtd. 04.04.2025 (01st) were confirmed and the office was instructed to get the final copy of minutes signed by the Chairman.

A. The following proposals were considered:

01. Sr. No.: 211(d) — **Grade- I buffer**

'Municipal Gymkhana Building'

Proposal: - Proposed redevelopment of Municipal Gymkhana building on plot bearing C.S. No. 1444 & part of 4.729 of Fort Division in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Municipal Architect.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/23139/DP-DyMA dated 06.02.2025;

ii) Earlier MHCC NOC dated ;

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

The building of 'Municipal Gymkhana' u/r is situated within 'MCGM Sub-Precinct' of 'Fort Precinct' listed at Sr. No. 633(12) in the heritage list.

The proposal: - It has been informed that as per the instruction of Hon'ble MC, proposal for construction of Town Hall building has been put up. The proposal comprises redevelopment of the existing Gymkhana building with construction of a new basement (2 levels) + ground floor + 1st to 4th floor + rooftop cafeteria & viewing gallery at 5th floor.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented in detail by the Deputy Municipal Architect (City). After comprehensive deliberation, the Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee (MHCC) expressed agreement with the overall redevelopment plan and issued the following recommendations:

1) Retention of original use:
   The primary use of the building as a Municipal Gymkhana must be retained. Therefore, in addition to its proposed function as a Town Hall, sports facilities for Municipal staff must be incorporated.
2) Inclusion of Sports Facilities for Municipal employees:
   The revised design should include two badminton courts, Swimming pool with allied facilities, Table tennis courts, gym and dedicated parking for the staff.
3) The applicant may explore the feasibility of adding additional basement floors, if necessary, to accommodate the recommended facilities.

The applicant was advised to revise the proposal in accordance with the above recommendations and resubmit the revised plans for MHCC's further consideration at the earliest.

02. Sr. No.:121 **Grade – I and Precinct**

'CSMT GM Building'

Proposal: - Proposed upgradation of interiors at CSMT G.M. building situated at Fort in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Sharayu More Associates for RLDA.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/23296/DP-DyMA dated 07.02.2025;

The 'Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Terminus' building, designed by the British architect F. W. Stevens, is an outstanding example of Victorian Gothic Revival Architecture in India blended with themes deriving from Indian traditional architecture. CSMT main building is a Grade-I structure listed at Sr. No. 121 in the heritage list and also part of 'Fort Precinct' and also an UNESCO World heritage site.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

Proposal: - The proposal contemplates upgradation of interiors of CSMT G.M. building including the following scope of the work:

1. Flooring- Removing incongruent new flooring, restoring the original flooring if in good condition, replacing damaged flooring with one matching the original design.
2. Ceiling- Scrapping off layers of paint to get an even surface for a new layer of paint.
3. Doors & windows—removing paint layers, checking and fitting loose joints, replacing later addition fittings, replacing broken glass panels, and unblocking blocked doors.
4. Walls- Removal of incongruent panelling, removal of paint and surface cleaning
5. Toilets- Addition of toilets on the first and second floors, as the existing number of toilets is insufficient.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented in detail during the meeting attended by the architect and representatives from the Rail Land Development Authority (RLDA). Given the heritage importance of the CSMT G.M. Building, the Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee (MHCC) decided that a site visit was essential to appropriately assess the scope and impact of the proposed interventions. Accordingly, the decision on the proposal has been deferred pending the site inspection.

It was also decided to inspect the site for the proposal of external restoration of CSMT G.M. building as submitted by Ar. Grishma Nandapurkar for Rail Land Development Authority (RLDA). The RLDA and the architects of the proposals were advised to take all safety measures until then.

03. Sr. No.:396 **Grade - III**

'Rocky Isle'

Proposal: - Proposed additions / alterations and vertical extension to the existing building known as 'Rocky Isle' situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 774 & 1/836 of Malabar Hill Division at Bhulabhai Desai Road in 'D' Ward.

Applicant: - Talati & Partners.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/1130/DP-DyMA dated 11.04.2025;

The building u/r known as 'Rocky Isles' (Vasudevs Residence with temple) is listed at Sr. No. 396 under Grade - III.

Proposal: - It has been informed that due to proximity to the sea, the building has undergone a lot of wear and tear and faces façade failure each monsoon. Additionally, in order to cater the growing needs of the family and availability of FSI it is proposed to add one more floor. The proposal contemplates repairs to the existing façade by replacing the faltering elements in

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

accordance with the original elevation of the existing building; with addition of one floor with same design language.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was explained in detail by the architect of the project. It was informed that the façade shall be repaired in like to like material and as per the original design of the building with an addition of one floor. The Committee after due consideration of all aspects, found the proposal approvable from heritage point of view however, it was decided that Structural Expert from the MHCC – Dr. Shashank Mehendale shall inspect the site and as per his recommendation, the proposal shall be considered in the upcoming MHCC meeting.

04. Sr. No.:153/14 **Grade II-B**

'Our Lady of Dolorous Church'

Proposal: - Proposed repairs cum refurbishment of façade of existing building known as 'Our Lady of Dolorous Church' on plot bearing C.S. no. 308 of Bhuleshwar Division in 'C' Ward, Dhobi Talao, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Patidar Alliance.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/25953/DP-DyMA dated 13.03.2025;

The site u/r known as 'Our Lady of Dolorous Church' is listed at Sr. No. 153/14 under Grade II-B in the heritage list of 2012.

Proposal: - The proposal contemplates repairs to the residential block behind the main church building. The following scope of work was considered by the Committee:

1) Repairs to the external plaster.
2) Repainting the external portion to match the existing paint shade.
3) Repairs to the mangalore tiled roofing with like to like material without any change in roof profile.
4) Repairs / replacement of window weather sheds.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was explained in detail by the architect of the project. The Committee found the proposed works approvable from heritage point of view and it was decided to grant its approval purely from heritage point of view subject to the following conditions:

i) that, structural stability and integrity of the existing building shall be ensured under the guidance of the structural consultant.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

ii) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities shall be obtained;

iii) that, additionalities on the front compound wall shall be removed to clear the view of front façade of the Church;

iv) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained.

v) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;

vi) Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained on completion of work.

05. Sr. No.:155 **Grade - I**

'Institute of Science'

Proposal: - Proposed new building for Nuclear and Radiation Labaratory at Institute of Science Premises in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Chief Architect PWD.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/24772/DP-DyMA dated 25.02.2025;

The site u/r known as 'Our Lady of Dolorous Church' is listed at Sr. No. 153/14 under Grade II-B in the heritage list of 2012.

Proposal: - The proposal contemplates redevelopment of the existing Nuclear and Radiation Labaratory lab building with construction of a new G+6 building with the height of 23.85M up to the terrace level.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - Considering the heritage significance of the existing structure and the strategic nature of the proposed usage, the Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee (MHCC) resolved that a site inspection is necessary to assess the proposal in context. The site was visited by the members of the MHCC. It was recommended that footprint of the existing building shall be maintained and height of the building shall be in harmony with the surrounding existing heritage structure. Subject to this and the general conditions of the MHCC, it was decided to grant the approval to the said proposal purely from heritage point of view.

06. Sr. No.:164 **Grade - I**

'CSMVS'

Proposal: - Proposed additions / alterations & structural repairs of Museum Annex Building situated in the campus of CSMVS, situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 1A/33, 1/33, 33 of Fort Division Mumbai.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

Applicant: - Architet Aparna Garud.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/2529/DP-DyMA dated 30.04.2025;

ii) MHCC NOC dated 14.12.2023;

The Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Vastu Sangrahalaya site is listed at Sr. No. 164 under Grade – I in the sanctioned heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - In this case, the MHCC had granted its approval for the said proposal vide letter dated 14.12.2023. The instant application seeks permission of the MHCC to use Malad Stone-Crete instead of Malad stone cladding.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was explained by the architect, and samples of both Malad stone and Stone-Crete were presented for the Committee's review. After thorough examination and discussion, the MHCC granted its consent for the use of Malad Stone-Crete in place of Malad stone cladding, as an acceptable substitute. All conditions specified in the earlier NOC dated 14.12.2023 shall continue to remain in force.

07. Sr. No.:254/19 **Grade II-A**

'Mafatlal House'

Proposal: - Proposed internal additions / alterations and erection of wooden partition at 6th floor (pt) of Mafatlal House, Fort Div. in 'A' Ward.

Applicant: - Architect Trimbak Khadilkar.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/24522/DP-DyMA dated 30.04.2025;

ii) MHCC NOC dated 14.12.2023;

The Mafatlal House House u/r is listed at Sr. No. 254/19 under Grade II-A in the sanctioned heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - The proposal contemplates internal additions / alterations at the part 6th floor of the said building which includes the following scope of work:

1) Proposed siporex partitions as per the layout.
2) Proposed gypsum board false ceiling.
3) Internal repairs such as change of tiling in toilets, plasterning, painting, electrification and plumbing etc.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was explained in detail by the architect of the project. The Committee found the proposed works approvable from heritage point of view and it was decided to grant its approval purely from heritage point of view subject to the following conditions:

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C

i) that, structural stability and integrity of the existing building shall be ensured under the guidance of the structural consultant.

ii) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities shall be obtained;

iii) that, for any subsequent changes in this proposal, amended NOC of the MHCC shall be obtained.

iv) that, this NOC is valid for the duration of two years from the date of this letter;

v) Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained on completion of work.

08. Sr. No.:Nil **Grade - Nil**

Proposal: - Letter from Adv. Makarand Narwekar regarding giving heritage status for iconic Irani Café / bakeries in Mumbai.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/25599/DP-DyMA dated 10.03.2025;

This is with reference to the representation received from Adv. Makarand Narwekar regarding giving heritage status for iconic Irani Café / bakeries in Mumbai. It is requested to grant hearing to the owners of to these Cafes / bakeries and arrange a site visit to these sites.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The details and all points mentioned in the representation were noted by the Committee. In order to get detailed information about all these site, the Committee requested Prof. Rajiv Mishra to carry out the study of all these Irani Cafes / bakeries in Mumbai through the J.J.College of Architecture and submit a comprehensive presentation for further consideration of the MHCC. The same was agreed by Prof. Rajiv Mishra – Principal J.J.College of Architecture.

The meeting then concluded with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

Chairman
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee