MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE **THIRTY SEVENTH** MEETING

Date: **Friday, 30.04.2021.**

Time: 02.30 to 5:30 PM

The following members were present:

• Dr. Ramanath Jha	Chairman;
• Prof. Rajiv Mishra	Principal, Sir J.J. College of Architecture.
• Dr. Manjiri Kamat	Historian, Mumbai University.
• Dr. P.P. Bhave	Environmental Engineer, VJTI.
• Dr. Abhay Bambole	HOD Structural Engineering, VJTI.
• Shri Sanjay Gedam	Chief Architect, PWD
• Shri Chetan Raikar	Structural Engineer and Conservation Expert.
• Ar. Kirtida Unwala	Conservation Architect.

The following officers were in attendance:

• Smt Aparna Bhatte	Dy. Mun. Architect (D.P.)
• Shri Deepak Bidve	Sr. Architect (D.P.)
• Shri Rituraj Karanjkar	Sub-Eng. (Architect) D.P.

Leave of absence was granted to Prof. A. A. Bage, Shri Kantikumar Pawar and Shri Sabyasachi Mukherjee, members of the Committee, who were unable to attend the meeting owing to preoccupations.

A. Confirmation of minutes of previous meeting:

Minutes of the previous MHCC meeting held on 09.04.2021 (36th) were confirmed and the office was instructed to get the final copy of minutes signed by the Chairman.

Scanned with CamScanner

B. The following new proposals were considered:

1. Sr. No: nil **Grade- I (buffer)**

'Restoration of Milestones in Mumbai'

Proposal: - Proposed installation Zero-milestone in the form of caste iron lamp-post opposite St. Thomas Cathedral.

Applicant: - Sr. H.C. Engineer.

Consultant: - Vastuvidhan Projects, Mumbai.

Reference: - i) Application u/no CHE/1616/DP-DyMA dated 27.04.2021;
ii) Earlier NOC dated 24.04.2018.

The proposed location for installation of the Zero Milestone is situated within combined heritage buffer of Grade I structures including St. Thomas Cathedral near Horniman Circle.

Scope of Work: - The MHCC had earlier granted it's NOC for restoration / installation of 13 milestones across Mumbai City, with a suggestion to come up with a proposal for Zero Milestone at St. Thomas Cathedral after verification of its historic information.
The instant proposal contemplates installation of Zero-milestone in the form of a lamp-post with nine arrows indicating directions of other Milestones, at the traffic divider on Veer Nariman Road, besides St. Thomas Cathedral.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by the consultant and E.E. HQ. It was explained that as suggested by the MHCC, authenticity of historic information was examined and it is now proposed to install a symbolic Zero-milestone on the road divider to enhance its visibility to public. The Committee after deliberations was of the opinion that as the St. Thomas Cathedral itself considered as Zero-milestone, the location of the symbolic Zero-milestone could be near the entrance side of the Church. The same may be discussed with the Church authorities. It was also suggested that design of the Milestone could be reconsidered to make it more authentic and commemorating the Zero-milestone; instead of a lamp-post. The applicant agreed to consider the suggestions and resubmit the proposal.

2. Sr. No: 39/42 **Grade II-A**

'Powai Lake'

Proposal: - Proposed rejuvenation and restoration of 'Powai Lake' periphery with provision of Cycle Track, Public Promenade and Urban Design

Scanned with CamScanner

interventions for improving pedestrianisation and upgraded public spaces around 'Powai Lake'.

Applicant: - H.E. MCGM.

Consultant: - Pankaj Joshi, Conservation Architect.

Reference: - Application u/no CHE/1315/DP-DyMA dated 22.04.2021;

The 'Powai Lake' u/r is listed at Sr. No. 39/42 as a Grade II-A site in the new heritage list of 2012.

Scope of Work: - It was informed by the applicant that MCGM intends to undertake rejuvenation of Powai Lake along with urban design interventions and upgraded public spaces. The broad scope of work of the proposal includes construction of built up walkway / cycle track by berming up edges of the lake with de-silted material, topped with concrete board, from i) Pawarwadi to IIT student hostel & ii) Renaissance Hotel cycle track to south end of Renaissance Hotel. If required, in exceptional marshy condition, board walk with retractable M.S. galvanized helical piles with structural profile decking sheet filled with concrete would be used.

Discussion of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by the consultant and officials from H.E. Dept. It was explained that proposal contemplates urban design interventions along the periphery of 'Powai Lake' to enhance the pedestrian / cycle movement, overall accessibility and public experience. It was also explained that boardwalk is permitted in the natural area as per the prevailing DCPR and all the existing trees and natural heritage is being retained. After due consideration of all aspects, the Committee was in-principally in favour of the proposal. However, the Committee made following observations:

i) Being a natural heritage site, careful study needs to be done about the compatibility of materials being proposed and it was suggested that concretization should be discouraged and more permeable surfaces should be created.

ii) As the walkways are proposed on the edge of the lake at some parts, important aspects such as sanctity / cleanliness of lake, safety / prosperity of aquatic ecosystem / habitat and aquatic life needs to be considered in the design.

iii) Consideration to public access points and parking requirements need to be given.

The applicant agreed to take cognizance of the aforesaid suggestions and revert.

Scanned with CamScanner

3. Sr. No: 181/229 **Grade: - II-A**

'Holy Magi Church'

Proposal: - Proposed repairs / improvement works at the Graveyard of 'Holy Magi Church' at Manori Gorai Road, Borivali (W) in R/C Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Holy Magi Church.

Architect: - Shirish Sukhatme & Associates.

Ref: - Application u/no. CHE/1188/DP-DyMA dated 22.04.2021.

The premises of Holy Magi Church situated in Gorai village, is included at Sr.No.181/229 under grade II-A in the new heritage list of 2012.

Scope of Work: - It was informed that the existing paving at the open space and graveyard is in deteriorated condition needs urgent repairs. The proposal contemplates repairs / replacement of the same with rough kotah stone and inscriptions templates in marble.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: – The proposal was explained by the architect and representative from the Church. It was explained that existing paving is in deteriorated condition and needs to be repaired before the monsoon. After due consideration and in view of the urgency of pre-monsoon works, the Committee decided to grant its in-principle NOC for the said proposal subject to the following:

i) that, structural stability of church / other buildings and sanctity of premises shall be ensured during course of work;

ii) that, details of inscription stones shall be as per original and authenticity shall be decided by Church authorities;

iii) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions should be obtained from concerned depts.;

iv) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained on completion of work at site.

4. Sr. No: 142(b) **Grade: - II-A**

'Hongkong and Shanghai Bank'

Proposal: - Proposed facade restoration of 'HSBC Bank building' situated at Veer Nariman Road, Fort, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Hongkong & Shanghai Bank.

Architect: - M/s Abha Lambah & Associates.

Ref: - Application u/no. CHE/1188/DP-DyMA dated 22.04.2021.

Scanned with CamScanner

The 'Hongkong & Shanghai Bank' building formerly known as 'British Bank of the Middle East' is listed at Sr. No. 142 (b) under Grade II-A in the heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - The scope of work as envisage by applicant includes the following:

1. Façade restoration for all facades & front arcade

- Stone cleaning of Malad & Porbunder stone.
- Paint removal from Porbunder stone.
- Dutchman repairs to Malad stone.
- Ammoniacal stone poulticing for decorative features.
- Lime plastic repairs to decorative features.
- Water repellent coating on stone façade after restoration.
- Re-plastering with cement plaster for additional Floor (3rd floor).
- Restoration of Italianate balusters at terrace level.

2. Fenestration restoration

- Front façade fenestrations to be changed to full glazed fixed windows
- Restoration of side & rear façade glazed & louvered windows; repairs to frame & glazed shutters and painted.

3. Terrace waterproofing

- New terrace waterproofing to be done at terrace level as suggested by Structural Consultant.

4. Site works

- Restoration of existing cast Iron Street Furniture like Railing, Lamp posts, signage.
- Addition of new signage on the front arcade.
- Front & side façade Illumination.

Discussion of the Committee in today's meeting: – The proposal was explained by the representative of the architect. It was informed that this property has been sold by the bank and acquisition of the said property is in process. Considering the fact that the original application was received from HSBC Bank and the current ownership of the building is in question, the Committee advised architect to first establish the legal ownership of the building and then re-submit the proposal as per the requirement of new client considering adaptive reuse in totality. The decision of the MHCC was deferred until such time.

C. The following new proposals were then considered:

1. Sr. No.: 76 **Grade- I**

Scanned with CamScanner

'Plaques near Rajabai Clock Tower and Library'

Proposal: - Proposed relocation of plaques at 'Rajabai Clock Tower and Library' in the campus of University of Mumbai in Fort, Mumbai.

Architect: - Somaya & Kalappa Consultants.

Ref: - i) Application u/no CHE/1127/DP-DyMA dtd.29.04.2021;
ii) Earlier NOC of the MHCC dated 28.06.2019.

The 'University of Mumbai' campus is listed at Sr. No. 76 as a Grade-I site in the heritage list. It is also part of the World Heritage Site of 'Victorian Gothic & Art Deco Ensembles of Mumbai'.

Proposal: - The MHCC had earlier granted its approval for the repairs and restoration of the Rajabai Tower and Library Building on 28.06.2021 wherein it was suggested to submit revised location and design scheme for existing plaques separately, for the consideration of the MHCC.

The instant proposal contemplates relocation and redesign of the existing information plaques situated in front of the Library Building and the Convocation Hall. The plaques are now proposed to be relocated on the opposite side of the road respectively. The information signage is proposed on 3mm brushed metal plate to be installed on external grade aluminium pedestal.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by the representatives of the architect. The Committee after due consideration, offered the following suggestions:

i) The Committee was of the opinion that the new proposed locations for plaques are very prominent; being right at the either side of the campus entrance. It was suggested to explore a more discreet but appropriate location for an information plaque.

ii) It was suggested that content of the plaque should emphasize information about the original heritage building rather than any later work or any organization / individual. The concerned authorities of the University may consider this suggestion and finalize the plaque content.

The applicant agreed to implement the aforesaid suggestions and submit revised proposal for consideration of the Committee.

2. Sr. No.: 211(d) **Grade- I buffer**

'Gateway of India Plaza'

Scanned with CamScanner

Proposal: - Proposed up-gradation of visitor facilities & plaza at 'Gateway of India' situated in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - E.E. (H.Q.).

Consultant: - M/s Abha Narain Lambah & Associates.

Reference: - i) Applications received on 22.02.2021, 12.03.2021 and 01.04.2021;
ii) MHCC Meetings dated 23.02.2021, 19.03.2021 & 09.04.2021;
iii) Site Visit dated 25.03.2021.

The site u/r i.e. visitor facilities and plaza are part of buffer / vista of 'Gateway of India' which is a Grade I heritage monument listed at Sr. No. 211(d) in the heritage list. It is also part of 'Gateway Sub Precinct' of Fort Precinct listed at Sr. No. 633(1).

The proposal: - It was informed by E.E.(H.Q.) that M/s Abha Narain Lambah Asso. have been appointed as PMC for said works, as per the approval of AMC (ES). The proposal contemplates demolition of existing ticket booking structure, toilet and other structures near the entrance canopy, with construction of redesigned landscaped plaza and other utility structures including ticketing / security, office, shops & toilet etc.

The proposal was discussed at length by the Committee in its meetings held on 23.02.2021, 19.03.2021 & 09.04.2021 when the Committee opined that the 'Gateway of India' being one of the most important heritage landmarks in the city, more deliberation and consideration of all aspects is necessary. The architect was requested to forward softcopy of the proposal for perusal of the Committee. The site was also visited by the Committee on 25.03.2021.

Discussion of the Committee in today's meeting: - The softcopy of the proposal as emailed by the architect on 20.04.2021 was noted. In view of all earlier considerations and discussions during site visit, the Committee found the submission inadequate to get clarity of the proposal. However, the Committee discussed the proposal on the basis of the observations made during the site visit. It was noted that most practical vantage points to appreciate Gateway Monument are i) end of Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Marg near the present entrance & ii) corner of Taj Mahal Hotel on P J Ramchandani Marg. The Committee opined that clearing up the existing plaza structure would not significantly enhance the view of the Gateway Monument as there are full grown trees in front of existing plaza and there is no adequate space on the MB Marg, in front of Royal Bombay Yacht Club for public to appreciate any view. Also, clearing up the plaza would only open the view to the existing fountain and rear side of the equestrian statue of Chattrapati Shivaji Maharaj. It was also informed by the architect that the present plaza structure is sparingly used. On these lines the Committee was of the opinion that instead of demolishing the existing plaza completely, possibility of internal remodelling of structure could be explored, to accommodate bare

Scanned with CamScanner

minimum functional requirements as may be decided by all stake holders; and some part of plaza at the centre could be opened up to facilitate the view from the road, if practically possible. This will also eliminate necessity of any other additional construction at the site, especially near the present entrance, with removal of all scattered porta-cabins and removal of the existing canopy at entrance which would open the view of the monument from the vantage point. Implementation of advanced surveillance / security technology could also be considered to reduce the physical requirement of structures and manpower. It was also suggested to consider the design of elements such as lamp-poles, seating, railings / fencing, dustbins etc. to be in harmony with the overall heritage ambience.

The architect was requested to reconsider the proposal on these lines and revert.

2. Sr. No.:95 **Grade- I**

'Maharashtra State Police Head Quarters'

Proposal: Proposed installation of the lift at main building and reconstruction / restoration of ancillary blocks in the premises of 'Maharashtra State Police Head Quarters' situated at Shahid Bhagat Singh Road near S.P.Mukherjee Chowk, 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: Exe. Eng. Presidency Division, PWD, Mumbai.

Consultant: M/s. Abha Lambah, Conservation Architect

Reference: i) Application u/no Che/26172/20.01.2020;
ii) Earlier MHCC NOC dated 09.07.2019;
iii) MHCC meetings dtd 29.01.2020, 07.07.2020, 21.07.2020, 10.09.2020, 04.02.2021 & 19.03.2021;
iv) Site visit dated 17.02.2020.

Location / Heritage Status: - The site u/r is listed at Sr. No. 95 as a Grade-I structure in the heritage list. The building designed by F.W. Stevens and built in 1872 – 76 was originally constructed to provide accommodation for the seamen and officers. The building is currently being used as the State Police Head Quarters.

Earlier, the Committee had granted its NOC for restoration of the main building of 'Maharashtra State Police Head Quarters' vide letter dated 09.07.2019. The Committee had advised checking approvability of the new proposed structure at rear side abutting compound wall. The architect had informed that the new building would be omitted from this proposal and separate proposal for the same would be put up in due course.

The proposal: - The scope of work as envisaged by applicant was as follows:

Scanned with CamScanner

i) Demolition of existing lift near central staircase and installation of new external lift by altering existing openings at rear side corridor.

ii) Proposed restoration and redesign / reconstruction of existing amenity blocks within the campus. The existing structures of security block and seating area abutting rear boundary are proposed to be reconstructed with a new G+1 structure with sloping roof. The existing structures of BEST substation and officers' restroom are proposed to be restored with replacement of existing RCC columns at front with historical wooden columns, restoration of door / windows as per historical details and stone cladding to existing walls.

The proposal was discussed by the MHCC in its meetings dated 29.01.2020, 07.07.2020, 21.07.2020,10.09.2020 & 04.02.2021. The location of the lift as proposed by the architect was found approvable. However, the details as submitted by architect were found unsatisfactory. The Committee also noted that despite several requests regarding confirmation of authenticity / approvability of existing amenity blocks, the clarification regarding the same has not been submitted by architect. In view of the above, the architect was again requested to submit the following for consideration of the MHCC:

i) Detailed drawings of proposed lift including all specifications and elevational details / projected on photographs.

ii) Structural stability report for the proposed interventions.

iii) The Committee reiterated its previous view that additional built mass within the Grade-I heritage site should be ideally avoided and the architect was requested to first confirm authenticity / approvability regarding reconstruction of amenity blocks u/r from concerned B.P. dept.

The matter was lastly discussed in the MHCC meeting dated 19.03.2021. The meeting was attended by representative of architect and I.G. (Admin) of Maharashtra Police, Shri Brijesh Singh. It was informed by Shri Brijesh Singh that it is not possible to get clear photographs of the rear side of the building where lift is intended to be installed due to other adjoining structures. However, it was assured that elevational details of lift in drawings format along with structural stability certificate for proposed interventions will be submitted at the earliest. It was also informed by architect that authenticity of the existing amenity structures shall also be submitted in consultation with PWD. The Committee decided to consider the matter on receipt of the aforesaid compliances.

The revised drawings of the lift proposal, structural stability certificate and letter from Superintendent – Aamdar Nivas regarding amenity blocks were received in email on 29.04.2021.

Scanned with CamScanner

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The revised online submission from architect was noted by the Committee. Considering the request of police department for functional necessity of the lift and its proposed location being at the rear side of the building, the Committee decided to grant its NOC for the installation of the lift as proposed subject to ensuring structural stability of the existing main building and obtaining all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities.

The letter from Superintendent – Aamdar Nivas regarding amenity blocks was also noted, wherein it has been informed that some of the blocks are temporary structures whereas officer's restroom, BEST station & entrance are on the record of PWD. In this regard the MHCC opined that authenticity and approvability of these structures first needs to be established by concerned B.P. dept. of the MCGM. Only after obtaining specific remarks from B.P. dept. in this regard, MHCC would be in position to offer its views about the restoration / remodelling proposal of these structures from heritage point of view.

3. Sr. No.: 141(13) **Grade II-A**

'Oricon House'

Proposal: - Proposed structural repairs / reconstruction to the existing building known as 'Oricon House' on plot bearing C.S. No. 135 of Fort Division at 14 K. Dubhash Marg, Fort, Mumbai.

Architect: - W.V.Kanhere.

Ref: - i) CHE/23667/DP-DyMA 17.03.2021;
ii) MHCC Meetings dated 28.08.2019, 19.03.2021 & 09.04.2021.

The building u/r known as 'Oricon House', situated at K. Dubhash Marg is listed at Sr. No. 141(13) under Grade II-A in the heritage list and also situated within Fort Precinct. The building u/r comprises Ground+3 floors with part mezzanine on all floors. Ground floor of the said building exhibits arcade with semicircular arch openings and decorative keystone feature. Overhanging upper floors are supported on decorative Iron brackets.

Scope of work: - The proposal contemplates extensive repairs to the said building including the following:

i) Existing slabs at all floors to be re-casted.
ii) Cracks in walls and structural members to be repaired.
iii) Existing corroded structural steel members to be replaced.
iv) Existing cement sheet roof with steel trusses to be replaced.
v) All windows to be replaced with similar pattern and teakwood/like to like material.
vi) Waterproofing treatment to terrace.

Scanned with CamScanner

vii) Guniting and plastering to external wall.

viii) Existing plumbing to be replaced with CPVC pipes.

The proposal was earlier discussed by the MHCC in its meeting held on 28.08.2019 when that the building u/r is listed under Grade II-A , however only the ground floor with high pedestrian arcade is significant from heritage point of view and the building is otherwise reconstructed with modern façade on upper floors. However, it was noticed by the Committee that steel supports which may not be original element of building for the cantilevered part of the facade were later added. The Committee advised architect to explore possibility of removing these columns by providing cantilevered slabs and also to design new elevation of building in sympathy with the surrounding heritage character. The suggestions were accepted by the applicant.

Discussion of the Committee in its meeting dated 19.03.2021: - The proposal was presented by the architect and structural consultant and it was explained that the facade shall be designed so as to match the surrounding heritage ambience and the structural columns / steel supports at front are proposed to be camouflaged with similar material to building facade. The Committee was in favour of the proposed repairs to the building and its redesign of the facade. However, the Committee reiterated its previous view that structural columns / steel supports at front, which are not original element of the building, shall be removed to restore the original identity of the structure.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The architect presented the revised scheme, proposing removal of the front structural supports as suggested by the MHCC. It was informed that additional supports are proposed at inside face of the original columns, which will not be visible from front. The Committee found this revised proposal approvable from heritage point of view and decided to grant its NOC for the said proposal subject to the following:

i) that, structural stability of the building shall be ensured and safety of adjacent buildings and habitants / pedestrians shall be ensured during course of the work;

ii) that, existing stone facade / arcade along with original brackets at ground floor should be retained and restored;

iii) that, recommended elevational features for above floors should be faithfully implemented during the execution of the work

iv) that, box grills should not be used for the windows and the external units of A.C., if any, should not be fixed on the front facade

v) that, this NOC is issued only from heritage point of view and authenticity/approvability of the proposal, including ownership, permissible F.S.I., setback, floors, structural

Scanned with CamScanner

stability etc. being subsequently examined and got approved from the concerned B.P. Dept. as per the provisions of prevailing DCPR and policies in force.

i) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained after completion of the work at site.

The meeting then concluded with a vote of thanks to the chair.

Chairman
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee

Scanned with CamScanner