MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE **FORTY FIFTH** MEETING

Date: **Wednesday, 05.01.2022.**

Time: 02.00 PM to 5:30 PM

The following members were present:

• Dr. Ramanath Jha	Chairman;
• Prof. Rajiv Mishra	Principal, Sir J.J. College of Architecture.
• Dr. Manjiri Kamat	Historian, Mumbai University.
• Dr. P.P. Bhave	Environmental Engineer, VJTI.
• Shri Chetan Raikar	Structural Engineer and Conservation Expert.
• Ar. Kirtida Unwalla	Conservation Architect.
• Dr. Kantikumar Pawar	Archaeologist / Conservation expert.

The following officers were in attendance:

• Smt Aparna Bhatte	Dy. Mun. Architect (D.P.)
• Shri Umesh Nagarkar	Dy. Mun. Architect (City)
• Shri Deepak Bidve	Sr. Architect (D.P.)
• Shri Rituraj Karanjkar	Sub-Eng. (Architect) D.P.

Leave of absence was granted to Prof. A. A. Bage, Dr. Abhay Bambole and Shri Sabyasachi Mukherjee, members of the Committee, who were unable to attend the meeting owing to preoccupations.

A. Confirmation of minutes of previous meeting:

Minutes of the previous MHCC meeting held on 20.12.2021 (44th) were confirmed and the office was instructed to get the final copy of minutes signed by the Chairman.

B. The following was discussed:

1. Policy regarding the role of the MHCC in the development works permissions for the listed Grade III & Precinct buildings.

This is with reference to development proposals in the listed heritage Precincts. In such cases, approval of the Hon'ble MC was obtained for allowing development without insisting

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE

Scanned with CamScanner

NOC of the MHCC, as the building u/r is neither Grade-I nor Grade-II but in a Precinct, as per regulation 52(9) of DCPR 2034.

The matter was deliberated by the MHCC at length. The Committee was of the opinion that the Precincts and Grade-III structures are part of the heritage list and they also form an integral part of the Mumbai's heritage and cultural landscape. The heritage precincts in Mumbai are rich and diverse in its architectural and heritage character; with precincts like Marine Drive & Fort being a part of UNESCO World Heritage Site. Heritage Precincts have been identified as special areas with historic character comprising similar or heterogeneous group of structures, with distinctive style and setting. The distinctive aspects lend themselves in the significant historic and cultural overtures encapsulating the architectural styles, built forms possessing structural and material/s aspects, overall heights that maintain the skyline, colour and texture etc. to provide an overall specialness to the place. Hence it is imperative that development works in precincts are sensitively looked upon from the angle of heritage conservation and special status given to the structures in the precincts should not be diluted. The heritage significance of the components / structures is embodied within the Grades – I, II and III respectively, and conform to having an overall co- ordinated heritage significance. Any change to such significance will be detrimental to the health of the Listed Heritage Precinct.

The MHCC has so far taken a view to balance the conservation of the built heritage and at the same time allowing sensitive development in the city. The Committee has now been informed by DP dept. that DCPR 2034 does not categorically mention requirement of approval from the MHCC for redevelopment works in the Precincts and Grade-III sites. However, the MHCC being the custodian of the heritage of the Mumbai city, is of the opinion that due diligence from heritage point of view is necessary for development works in the heritage Precincts / structures to maintain the aesthetics & character of the city.

The Committee also noted the regulation 52(6) of DCRP 2034 which reads, '*Buildings included in listed/published draft Heritage Precincts shall, as far as possible, maintain the sky-line in the precincts as may be existing within the Precinct boundary excluding any high-rise new development. So as not to diminish or destroy the value and beauty of the said listed Heritage buildings/Heritage Precincts. The development within the precincts shall be in accordance with respective Precinct guidelines as formulated by the Municipal Commissioner in consultation with MHCC or as may be decided by the Municipal Commissioner, shall require sanction by Government. Guidelines for display of hoarding, signage, advertisement boards, street-furniture, pavement shall be formulated by the MHCC*' It was also noted that the MHCC, in the past, has prepared guidelines for the 'Marine Drive Precinct' as per the

Scanned with CamScanner

direction of Hon'ble Court, which have been forwarded to U.D. dept. by then M.C. for approval and further process.

Considering all the above and provisions of regulation 52.6 of DCRP 2034, the MHCC unanimously decided to recommend the following to Hon'ble M.C. for consideration:

1. MHCC shall formulate draft of comprehensive guidelines for development works and other interventions in all individual precincts.
2. Until such guidelines are formed and sanctioned by the Government, the MHCC shall continue to consider such proposals on its merits, to allow the sensitive development in the heritage precincts / sites and preserve the heritage significance of the city at the same time.

C. The following proposals were then considered:

1. Sr. No: 121 **Grade - I**

'Chattrapati Shivaji Maharaj Terminus'

Proposal: - Proposed development works and integrated mobility plan at 'Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Terminus' situated in Fort in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Applicant: - CGM Projects / planning, Indian Railway Stations Development Corporation Ltd.

Consultant: - M/s AECOM.

Reference: - i) Online meeting with U.D. dept. dated 10.06.2021;
ii) MHCC Meeting dated 19.06.2021 & 20.12.2021;
iii) Application dated 08.11.2021;
iv) Site visit dated 24.12.2021.

The 'Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj Terminus' building, designed by the British architect F. W. Stevens, is an outstanding example of Victorian Gothic Revival Architecture in India blended with themes deriving from Indian traditional architecture. CSMT main building is a Grade-I structure listed at Sr. No. 121 in the heritage list and also part of 'Fort Precinct'. Its surrounding area is marked as a buffer / vista. It is also a UNESCO World heritage site.

An online meeting dated 10.06.2021 was convened by U.D. dept. of GoM in the subject matter. It was informed in the meeting that as a part of master plan, development works at CSMT has been taken up by IRSDC and M/s AECOM have been appointed as technical consultant for the same. The broad scope of work as proposed by applicant was as following:

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE ★ C.C.

Scanned with CamScanner

1) Suburban and long-distance nodes are proposed, elevated above the railway tracks. The two elevated nodes (decks) will ease and segregate the two major functions of railway station.
2) FOB connecting the two major nodes which improves connectivity and ease movement between two nodes. FOB also enhances connectivity to Crawford market and DN road.
3) Heritage character of the area is to be restored to its past glory, rediscovered and reintegrated into the fabric of the city. Offices in Annex Building and Main Line Building to be relocated New Annex building and other structure constructed post independence to be removed. Parking and drop-off areas to be created and existing area to be converted into a covered plaza. Maximum height limit of surrounding building is 24m.
4) All weather cover / roofing system is proposed over the long distance train platform and roof over the suburban platforms i.e. 1-7 is proposed to be restored.

Discussion of the MHCC in its meeting dated 19.06.2021: - The preliminary aspects of the proposal were noted by the MHCC as mentioned in the submitted presentation. The Committee was of the impression that Grade-I heritage listed buildings along with the concourse lobby / facade and suburban platforms with its roofing system are proposed to be conserved in its originality. It was noted that the physical interventions in the form of waiting lounge building and deck above the platforms would be outside the Grade-I listed site and its prescribed buffer zone. The Committee was not averse to the proposed works, however, considering the significance of this iconic heritage site to the city, the Committee advised applicant to present the comprehensive proposal with all details including restoration details, designs of new interventions, material specifications etc. The Committee also opined that cognizance of the suggestions given by the MHCC in its approval to the comprehensive conservation proposal of CSMT in 2019, should be taken.

Submission dated 08.11.2021: - A revised presentation prepared by the consultant was submitted for further consideration of the MHCC. The instant proposal contemplates preparation of master plan which broadly includes the following:

1. All additionalities to the annexe building and mainline building to be removed as shown in plans. Additional floors which were subsequently constructed will be removed with restoration of the original roof & other architectural details.
2. Proposed construction of new annexe building with the height of max. 24M.
3. South side entrance is proposed to be converted into pedestrian only with a new roofing system at the entrance between suburban & long distance platforms, along

Scanned with CamScanner

with escalators and lift blocks connecting to the structure above existing platform no.7.

4. Proposed development of area at entrance from P D'mello road with construction of railway offices with the height up to 24M, as shown in the plan.
5. Proposed construction of two elevated decks / platforms as waiting area above suburban & long distance tracks on the northern end, as shown in the plan with interconnected networks of FOBs.
6. Historical roof over all heritage areas and suburban tracks is proposed to be retailed / restored and new roof for all other new areas is proposed.

The proposal was considered by the MHCC in its meeting held on 20.12.2021 and the site was visited by the Committee along with the representatives of the applicant on 24.12.2021.

Decision of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The overall proposal and observations made during the visit were noted in today's meeting. It was explained by applicant during visit that this phase of the proposal contemplates preparation of master plan with proposed building blocks with its scale / height. It was informed that the details of the proposed buildings (plans / elevations), details of the other interventions and the restoration detailing of the heritage buildings will be submitted subsequently under the next phase. The Committee was in consonance with the overall master-plan as proposed, except the proposed location for the public toilet block. The Committee requested applicant to find suitable alternate location for public toilet block, considering the aesthetics of heritage area and convenience of the public at the same time. Considering all the above, the MHCC decided to grant its in-principle NOC for the master plan of the subject proposal, subject to the following conditions:

i) that, structural stability of the heritage buildings shall be ensured during course of the work;
ii) that, this NOC is granted only for the proposed master plan and all the details of the proposed buildings (plans, sections, elevations, material specifications), details of the restoration of the original structures (scope, methodology, material specifications etc.) & details of all other interventions including signage, to be carried out shall be separately submitted for the consideration of the MHCC before execution;
iii) that, cognizance of the suggestions given by the MHCC in its approval to the comprehensive conservation proposal of CSMT in 2019, should be taken;
iv) that, all works should be carried out as per conservation norms and under expert supervision;
v) that, all signage should be sensitively designed and located so as not to affect the aesthetics of the heritage structures. Commercial advertisements / hoardings should not be placed in / on the heritage structures;

Scanned with CamScanner

vi) that, suitable alternate location for public toilet block as suggested shall be explored and submitted separately for consideration of the MHCC;

vii) that, the site being the WHS, due cognizance of guidelines of UNESCO, if any, should be taken into consideration;

viii) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities should be obtained;

The applicant was requested to submit final set of master plans along with details of interventions at this stage, if any, for issuance of formal NOC of the MHCC.

2. Sr. No.: 130 **Grade – II-A**

'TCS House / Rallis House'

Proposal: - Proposed internal additions / alterations, erection of partitions for the cabins for ground, 1st & 2nd floor of the building known as 'TCS House' (Rallis House) situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 1411 & 1412 of Fort Division in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Architect: - M/s Harsh Gangar & Associates.

Ref: - CHE/DP/13390/Dp-DyMA dated 15.09.2021;

The building u/r known as TCS House / Rallis House is listed at Sr. No. 130 under Grade II-A in the heritage list.

Scope of work: - It is informed that the premises u/r is situated on ground, 1st & 2nd floor of the building u/r. It is proposed to remove existing walls / partitions on both floors and new partitions (wood / glass & lightweight siporex blocks) as per new layout have been proposed. It is further informed that there is no change in the external façade of the said building in any way. Structural stability certificate for the said works is also submitted.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by representative of applicant. It was explained that scope of work is purely internal and does not involve any structural changes or changes to façade in any way. The Committee found the proposed scope of work approvable from heritage point of view and decided to grant its NOC purely from heritage point of view subject to ensuring structural stability of the building and obtaining all other applicable permissions from concerned depts.

3. Sr. No.: 287 & 288 **Grade – II-B**

'Pipla Chawl in Shri Krishna Mandir Complex'

Scanned with CamScanner

Proposal: - Proposed 100% repairs amounting to reconstruction of building known as 'Pipla Chawl' situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 279/4 of Bhuleshwar Division in 'C' Ward, Mumbai.

Architect: - M/s Precision Consultants.

Ref: - CHE/DP/10999/Dp-DyMA dated 11.08.2021;

The building u/r is part of the larger Grade II-B site listed under the name 'Shri Krishna Mandir Complex (Motta Mandir).

Scope of work: - The proposal contemplates repairs amounting to reconstruction of the said ground+2 storied structure which is presently in dilapidated condition. It is proposed to repair the structure with R.S. Columns, beam and slabs /roof with R.S joist ladi-cobe-ladi. It is informed that the said proposal has been approved by Hon'ble MC vide note-sheet dated 05.12.2020 subject to obtaining NOC of the MHCC.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by applicant and it was informed that the said structure is not a listed heritage building and not part of the temple but only situated within the larger heritage site of 'Shri Krishna Mandir Complex'. It was also informed that the structure u/r is in dilapidated condition and has been vacated from safety point of view. Considering all, the MHCC decided to grant its NOC from heritage point for the proposal as already approved by Hon'ble MC, subject to the following conditions:

i) that, structural stability of the surrounding buildings shall be ensured during course of the work. Sanctity of the temple premises shall be maintained.

ii) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and authenticity / approvability of the proposal including ownership, user and area calculations /FSI etc. should be examined & confirmed by the concerned B.P. Dept in accordance with the prevailing DCPR and policies in force. All other applicable permissions should be obtained from concerned authorities;

iii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site.

4. Sr. No: 101/122 **Grade: - III**

'Cyrilyn'

Proposal: - Proposed redevelopment of property known as 'Cyrilyn' on plot bearing CTS No. 470 of Village Bandra-H in H/W Ward, Bandra, Mumbai.

Architect: - M/s The Designcore.

Ref: - Application u/no. CHE/12177/DP-DyMA dated 27.08.2021.

Scanned with CamScanner

The building u/r known as 'Cyrilyn' is included at Sr. No. 101/122 under Grade III in the heritage list of 2012.

Proposal: - The proposal contemplates redevelopment of existing ground + 1 storied building with the construction of new stilt + 9 storied building with the height of 31.95 M up to the terrace floor.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal including the documentation of existing structure and height study analysis of surrounding area was presented in today's meeting. The Committee noted that the surrounding area has already been developed with buildings with similar height pattern and the proposed elevation of the building was also found approvable from heritage point of view. Considering all, the MHCC decided to grant its NOC for the said proposal purely from heritage point of view subject to the following conditions:

i) that, height of service structures above terrace level shall be kept as minimal as possible

ii) that, this NOC is issued only from heritage point of view and authenticity/approvability of the proposal, including ownership, user, permissible F.S.I., open spaces / setback etc. being subsequently examined and got approved from the concerned B.P. Dept. as per the provisions of prevailing DCPR and policies in force.

iii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained on completion of the said work at the site.

5. Sr. No: 633 **Grade: - Precinct**

'Laxmi Bhuvan'

Proposal: - Amended proposal for reconstruction of existing building known as 'Laxmi Bhuvan' on land bearing C.S. No. 926 of Fort Division in 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Architect: - M/s Consultants Combined.

Ref: - i) Application u/no. CHE/18102/DP-DyMA dated 23.11.2021;
ii) Earlier NOCs of the MHCC dated 04.06.2013 & 02.11.2020.

The site u/r is not individually listed but situated in 'Bazar Gate Heritage Precinct' listed at Sr. No. 633/10 in published heritage list of 'A' ward.

Proposal: - In this case the MHCC had earlier granted its NOCs dated 04.06.2013 & 02.11.2020 for reconstruction proposal on the said site. Subsequently as per the requirement of CFO, the sloping roof as approved earlier is now proposed to be converted into flat roof to

Scanned with CamScanner

act as refuge area. It is informed that said amended proposal has been approved by Hon'ble M.C. with a condition to remove chajjas projecting on the road.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The amendments in the subject proposal were noted by the MHCC. Considering the specific requirement of CFO, from safety point of view, the Committee decided to grant its NOC for the said proposal purely from heritage point of view subject to the following conditions:

i) That, structural stability / provision for said amended works shall be ensured by the structural consultant

ii) that, height of service structures above terrace level shall be kept as minimal as possible

iii) that, this NOC is issued only from heritage point of view and authenticity/approvability of the proposal, including ownership, user, permissible F.S.I., open spaces / setback etc. being subsequently examined and got approved from the concerned B.P. Dept. as per the provisions of prevailing DCPR and policies in force.

iv) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained on completion of the said work at the site.

6. Sr. No: 633 **Grade: - Precinct**

'Mehta Building'

Proposal: - Proposed repairs and restoration of 'Mehta Building' situated on Nagindas Master Road in Fort, 'A' Ward, Mumbai.

Architect: - Vikas Dilawari.

Ref: - Application u/no. CHE/18736/DP-DyMA dated 30.11.2021.

The site u/r is not individually listed but situated in 'Bazar Gate Heritage Precinct' listed at Sr. No. 633/10 in published heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - The scope of proposed works as contemplated by applicant and considered by the MHCC are as follows:

Civil works:

1. RCC Chajja to be repaired with polymer mortar or micro concreting as per site condition and re waterproofing the same and repainting it after completion of work.
2. Loose and cracked plaster surface on the façade to be re plastered.
3. Waterproofing to be redone on lower terrace floor on the northern side.
4. Existing corrugated ACC roof in poor condition to be replaced with new ACC Corrugated sheet.

Scanned with CamScanner

5. Removal of false ceiling, at all internal levels where possible, checking the loose cover /plaster of the slab and repair with polymer mortar or micro concrete as per site condition, re plastering the same where required and re-painting.
6. Existing RCC column, beam, slab, lintel, etc. of all internal areas to be repaired with polymer or micro concrete as per site condition after close inspection.

Carpentry works:

1. Minor repairs of all external windows to be done.
2. Missing TW ventilator shutter to be reconstructed matching to the existing original ventilator shutter.
3. Existing damaged bison board chajjas to be redone with TW Frame and Bison board.

Painting works:

1. External façade to be completely repainted in Apex Ultima.
2. Internally common area to be entirely painted, internal areas of offices to be painted locally where structural work will be done.

Others

1. All the signage boards to be removed and re fixed after RCC Chajja repairs.
2. Plumbing to be checked, where faulty to be replaced.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by the architect in today's meeting. After due consideration, the MHCC decided to grant its NOC purely from heritage point of view for the said proposal subject to the following:

i) that, structural stability of the building shall be ensured during course of the work.
ii) that, external colour scheme of the building should be lighter / neutral so as to match with the other buildings in the said precinct;
iii) that. all signage / displays to be streamlined and shall be bare minimum in size;
iv) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions should be obtained from concerned authorities;
v) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site.

7. Sr. No: 10 **Grade: - I**

'The Church of St. John The Evengelist (Afghan Church).'

Proposal: - Proposed conservation of 'The Church of St. John The Evangelist (Afghan Church)' situated at Duxbury Lane, Colaba, Mumbai.

Architect: - Kirtida Unwalla.

Ref: - Application u/no. CHE/14754/DP-DyMA dated 23.11.2021.

Scanned with CamScanner

The site u/r of 'The Church of St. John The Evangelist' also known as 'Afghan Church' is listed at Sr. No. 10 as Grade-I in the heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - It was informed that phase-wise restoration works of the said building have commenced since 2004. The instant proposed works are being undertaken on behest of Church Pastorate Committee and World Monument Fund India Association, which includes the following:

Roof Works:

i) Removal of asbestos cement sheet roofing.
ii) Repairs and treatment to woodwork.
iii) Water proofing membrane with aluminium sheeting.
iv) Roofing with Mangalore tiles.

Exterior Façade works:

i) Structural repairs as required by grouting and stitching techniques.
ii) Removal of hard pointing mortar & re-pointing with traditional lime.
iii) Stone cleaning, repairs, poulticing and grouting.

Interior wall and ceiling works:

i) Varnish removal from the ceiling and re-varnishing the timber.
ii) Removal of hard plaster from walls and re-plastering with traditional lime mortar.
iii) Stone cleaning of stone columns and arches.
iv) Stained glass works, door / window repairs and varnishing / panting.

Miscellaneous works:

i) Removal of hard apron and inserting a plinth protection and french drain.
ii) Electrical and landscape works.
iii) Anti-termite treatment to wall foundation.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The proposal was presented by the architect Kirtida Unwalla in today's meeting, who also being member of the Committee recused herself from further deliberations / discussions in this case. The proposed scope of work was found approvable and after due consideration, the MHCC decided to grant its NOC purely from heritage point of view for the said proposal subject to the following:

i) that, structural stability of the building shall be ensured during course of the work;
ii) that, all works should be carried out as per conservation norms and under expert supervision;
iii) that, only subtle scheme & warm tones shall be opted for illumination. Extreme care should be taken for fixing the lights so as not to damage any stone surface / architectural feature of the building;

Scanned with CamScanner

iv) that, only non-abrasive techniques for stone cleaning shall be opted and no chemical coating / paint shall be used on stone surface

v) that, this being a Grade-I heritage site, periodic reporting of ongoing works should be submitted to MHCC;

vi) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities should be obtained;

vii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site.

8. Sr. No: 211c **Grade: II-A**

'Taj Mahal Hotel'

Proposal: - Proposed renovation / repairs to the existing swimming pool within the compound of 'Taj Mahal Hotel' situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 405 of Colaba Division, Mumbai.

Architect: - Director of Eng., The Indian Hotels Company Ltd.

Ref: - Applications received on 04.10.2021 & 23.11.2021.

The 'Taj Mahal Hotel' u/r is listed at Sr. No. 211c under Grade II-A in the heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - The scope of repairs work as contemplated by applicant and considered by the MHCC was as follows:

i) Reducing the depth of the existing swimming pool from 10 feet to 4.5 feet.

ii) Removing the existing glazed tiles from the swimming pool, re-plastering the same with waterproofing compound and thereafter fixing new glass mosaic tiles in the swimming pool.

iii) Replacing the deck area flooring.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - After due consideration, the MHCC found the proposed scope of work approvable from heritage point of view and decided to grant its NOC for the said proposal subject to the following:

i) that, all works should be carried out as per conservation norms and under expert supervision and extreme care should be taken in terms of waterproofing;

ii) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities should be obtained;

iii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE

Scanned with CamScanner

'Bombay Gymkhana'

Proposal: - Proposed renovation of Custodian's area, Table Tennis area and Children's Library in the verandah of ground floor of the 'Bombay Gymkhana' building situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 730 of Fort Division, M.G. Road, Fort, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Architect Aparna Garud

Reference: - i) Applications received on 27.10.2021 & 11.01.2022;
ii) MHCC meeting dated 20.12.2021;
iii) Site Visit dated 24.12.2021.

The site u/r of 'Bombay Gymkhana' is listed at Sr. No. 180 under Grade II-B in the heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - The proposal contemplates renovation works of the part area of the verandah for Custodian's area, Table Tennis area and Children's Library, on the ground floor of the Bombay Gymkhana building. The area u/r with the said existing use has become inadequate of the required user and renovation of the area has been proposed.

The proposal was discussed by the MHCC in its meeting held on 20.12.2021 and the site was also visited by the MHCC on 24.12.2021.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The observations of the site visit were noted and the proposed scope of work was found to be approvable from heritage point of view. Considering all, the MHCC decided to grant its NOC from heritage point of view for the said proposal subject to the following conditions:

i) that, structural stability of the building should be ensured during course of the work;
ii) that, all works should be carried out as per conservation norms and under expert supervision;
iii) that, all original architectural features / elements, colourscheme of the building & façade should be maintained / restored and grid of openings, design / pattern of windows, roof patterns and historic flooring & patterns should be maintained as original;
iv) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities should be obtained;
v) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site.

Scanned with CamScanner

10. Sr. No.: 180 **Grade – II-B**

'Bombay Gymkhana'

Proposal: - Painting and polishing work in the ground floor Verandah of ground floor of the 'Bombay Gymkhana' building situated on plot bearing C.S. No. 730 of Fort Division, M.G. Road, Fort, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Architect Aparna Garud

Reference: - i) Applications received on 02.11.2021 & 11.01.2022;
ii) MHCC meeting dated 20.12.2021;
iii) Site visit dated 24.12.2021.

The site u/r of 'Bombay Gymkhana' is listed at Sr. No. 180 under Grade II-B in the heritage list of 'A' Ward.

Proposal: - It was informed that as a part of regular maintenance, when the gymkhana was closed during the lockdown, some works were carried out on urgent basis as following:

i) Painting and polishing in verandah area.
ii) Replacement of damaged plywood ceiling boards with bison panel boards. The look of the ceiling has been maintained the same with the white paint as was originally present.
iii) Some panels on the side of verandah have been replaced with bison panel boards, maintaining the same colour and finish.
iv) Small windows which were damaged during rains were repaired / replaced with same material and design.

The proposal was discussed by the MHCC in its meeting held on 20.12.2021 and the site was also visited by the MHCC on 24.12.2021.

Decision of the Committee in today's meeting: - The observations of the site visit were noted by the Committee. During visit, it was explained by the architect that works as mentioned were carried out as per the original design / specification and colour-scheme and using like to like materials. The Committee was of the opinion as the works that have been carried out are minor in nature and were found to be approvable from heritage point of view. However, the Committee advised architect to obtain prior NOC of the MHCC before carrying out any works in the premises. It was also advised to prepare a comprehensive maintenance plan for the heritage site which could be then followed for periodic maintenance. Considering all, the MHCC decided to grant its NOC for the aforesaid works in the Gymkhana lobby, purely from heritage point of view, subject to the following:

vi) that, structural stability of the building should be ensured during course of the work;

Scanned with CamScanner

vii) that, all works should be carried out as per conservation norms and under expert supervision;

viii) that, all original architectural features / elements of the building & façade should be maintained / restored and grid of openings, design / pattern of windows, roof patterns and historic flooring & patterns should be maintained as original;

ix) that, this NOC is granted only from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned authorities should be obtained;

x) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC shall be obtained after completion of work at site.

D. The following was noted:

Subject: - Permission for video shooting for movie at Nariman Point, Marine Drive and Gateway of India Premises on date 01.01.2022 to 02.01.2022.

Applicant: - Mangesh Desai, Saahil Motion Arts.

Ref: - Application received on 31.12.2021.

This is with reference to the letter received from Shri Mangesh Desai, Saahil Motion Arts, requesting permission for video shooting for a movie at Nariman Point, Marine Drive and Gateway of India Premises in 'A' Ward, on date 01.01.2022 to 02.01.2022.

The said matter was discussed with the Chairman MHCC and considering the nature of work, consent for the video shooting at said locations on said *dates*, only from heritage point of view was granted subject to the following conditions:

i) that, care should be taken that arrangements of the said shooting should not damage / mar the heritage sites in any way;

ii) that, proposed event should not cause any kind of pollution or harm any buildings in the vicinity;

iii) that, protocols against Covid-19 as stipulated by the concerned authorities & govt. shall be strictly followed;

iv) that, all other permissions including Ward office and Police shall be obtained;

v) that, all temporary arrangement for the shooting shall be removed after stipulated time.

Jamanalal Jha

Chairman
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee

Scanned with CamScanner