

**MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI**

**MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF THE TWENTY THIRD MEETING**

Date: **Thursday, 26 / 06 / 2020.**

Time: 12.30 am to 02.30 pm

The following members were present:

- Dr. Ramanath Jha Chairman;
- Dr. Manjiri Kamat Historian, Mumbai University.
- Dr. P.P. Bhave Environmental Engineer, VJTI.
- Prof. Rajiv Mishra Principal, Sir J.J. College of Architecture.
- Shri Sanjay Gedam Chief Architect, Govt. of Maharashtra.
- Shri Chetan Raikar Structural Engineer and Conservation Expert.
- Shri Kantikumar Pawar Archeologist / conservation expert.

The following officers were in attendance:

- Smt Aparna Bhatte Dy. Mun. Architect (D.P.)
- Shri Deepak Bidve Sr. Architect (D.P.)
- Shri Rituraj Karanjkar Sub-eng (Architect) D.P.

Leave of absence was granted to Dr. Sandeep Pendhari, Prof. A. A. Bage and Shri Sabyasachi Mukherjee, members of the Committee.

**A. Confirmation of minutes of previous meeting:**

Minutes of the previous MHCC meeting held on 08.06.2020 (22<sup>nd</sup>) were confirmed and the office was instructed to get the final copy of minutes signed by the Chairman.

**B. The following new proposals were considered:**

**1. Sr. No.:146/7**

**Grade: II-A & Precinct**

**'Mumbai Coastal Road Package IV'**



Proposal: - Prescription of RL on part portion of N.S. Road abutting Hindu gymkhana & other gymkhanas, for construction of Mumbai Coastal Road package IV from Princess Street flyover to Priyadarshini Park, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Dy. Ch. E (Traffic) / Ch.E.(Coastal Road).

Reference: - i) CHE/1268/DP-DyMA dated 16.06.2020;

ii) NOC of the MHCC dated 28.10.2016.

The prescribed R.L. on part portion of N.S. Road for construction of Mumbai Coastal Road package IV is situated within Marine Drive Precinct and abuts /affects the heritage sites of Hindu Gymkhana and all other gymkhanas along the road up to Taraporwala Aquarium.

**Earlier NOC:** - The MHCC had granted its NOC vide letter dated 28.10.2016 for revised alignment of the Mumbai Coastal Road project at 'Marine Drive' and near 'Bandra Fort' with suggestion to submit alignment and tunnel details etc separately in due course for consideration of the MHCC.

**Instant proposal:** - Reference is given to the letter from Ch.E (Coastal Road) regarding the work of construction of Mumbai Coastal Road from Princess Street flyover to Bandra Worli Sea-link, which is in progress. As per the said note the alignment of part portion of service road abutting various Gymkhanas situated at Marine Drive is required for Coastal Road work i.e mainly for cut and cover tunnel, ramp portion and for merging lane with N.S. Road. It is also informed that this is only portion available for expansion of south bound carriageway near Hindu Gymkhana where service road is narrow. Due to which after utilization of part portion of service road for Coastal Road, effective average width of service road will be 1.40 m at Hindu Gymkhana for vehicular & pedestrian movement which may cause congestion on service road and hence requires widening of service road.

It is informed that total width of existing road is 50m approx. and it is proposed to prescribe R.L of same width to N.S. road from points (A) to (B) as marked on submitted drawing. The proposed widening affects the land of Hindu Gymkhana and petrol pump at junction. It is further informed that area of setback is very minor and no trees are affected in the setback due to road widening. The remarks of the MHCC have been sought for the said proposal.

**Discussion of the Committee in today's meeting:** - The proposal was presented by the officials from Coastal Road dept. and it was informed that as the alignment cannot be accommodated at seaward side due to technical limitations, option of widening existing service road has been proposed. The Committee was of the opinion that the Marine Drive Precinct is one of the significant heritage landmarks of the City and its openness and ambience needs to be preserved. The Committee was not amenable about forfeiting open space of Gymkhana for the purpose and inquired whether any other alternative could be





worked out. The Committee also expressed concern about existing trees / vegetation along the service road. The Committee decided to visit the site for better understanding and requested Coastal Road / Traffic dept. to make detailed presentation for the said proposal in next MHCC meeting.

**2. Sr. No.:161**

**Grade: II-B**

**'Elphistone Technical Institute'**

Proposal: - Proposed restoration of Elphistone Technical Institute building, situated at Mahapalika Marg, Fort, Mumbai.

Applicant: - Executive Engineer, Presidency Div. PWD.

Architect: - M/s. Abha Lambah, Conservation Architect

Reference: - CHE/01294/DP-DyMA dated 17.06.2020.

The building u/r is listed at Sr. No. 161 under the name 'Elphistone Technical Institute with Rangbhavan Building' as a Grade II-B site in the heritage list.

**Proposal:** - It is informed that PWD dept. has envisaged restoration of the said building and M/s Abha Narain Lambah has been appointed as conservation architect for the same. The broad scope of proposed work includes:

- 1) Restoration of roof and structural repairs.
- 2) Restoration of the façade with gentle stone cleaning, re-pointing in lime mortar.
- 3) Restoration of doors and windows.
- 4) Removal of incongruous additions along the exterior façade.
- 5) Restoration of corridors and verandahs.
- 6) Restoration of interior halls.
- 7) Up-gradation of electrical works.
- 8) Restoration of furniture and historic elements.
- 9) Compound wall works.

**Decision of the Committee in today's meeting:** - The proposal was presented by architect and the details of proposed works were explained. The Committee requested applicant to submit the following:

- i) Structural report of the project along with details of structural restoration and repairs for better understanding of the structural systems and repairs methodology.
- ii) Specific details / drawings of the restoration works including existing materials / proposed materials and methodology of restoration.
- iii) Accessibility audit of the structure.



After due consideration of all aspects, the Committee decided to grant its in-principle consent for the essential repairs to the structure. However, the architect was advised submit the aforesaid details (phase-wise, if required) and obtain approval of the MHCC for the same before starting any restoration works.

**3. Sr. No.:39**

**Grade: II-A**

**'Commissioner of Police Office (Police Headquarters)'**

Proposal: - Proposed installation of 2<sup>nd</sup> lift at the rear side of the Commissioner of Police office situated at junction of D.N. Road and L.T. Road in Fort, Mumbai.

Architect: - M/s. Abha Lambah, Conservation Architect.

Reference: - CHE/01296/DP-DyMA dated 17.06.2020.

The building u/r is listed at Sr. No. 39 under the name 'Police Headquarters' as a Grade II-A structure in the heritage list. The building u/r reflects Neo-Gothic architectural style which is prominently seen in the Fort area.

**Proposal:** - Earlier the MHCC had granted its NOC for installation of a lift at N-W Corner of the building vide letter dated 23.012.2019. It is now proposed to install a 2<sup>nd</sup> lift at rear side of the building. Two options for the location have been submitted i) at S-E corner within existing staircase block. ii) externally at rear façade with existing structure to be continued up to 2<sup>nd</sup> floor and glass cladding for lift at second floor.

**Discussion of the Committee in today's meeting:** - The proposal was presented by the applicant and it was explained that as per the requirement from the owner, second lift is proposed for public utility. The Committee, considering the heritage significance of the building was not in favour of additional interventions to the said building. The Committee requested architect to re-evaluate necessity of the second new lift in the building. The architect agreed to discuss the same with the user and revert.

**4. Sr. No.: 633(13)**

**Grade – Precinct**

**'Spectator Steps – Azad Maidan'**

Proposal: - Proposed reconstruction of existing spectator steps (sitting tiers) on C.S. 729 (pt) of Fort Division on 'Azad Maidan', Mahapalika Marg, Mumbai.

Architect: - M/s Anil Patil.

Ref: - Application u/no Che/27812/DP-DyMA dated 03.02.2020.





The site u/r located at north side of Azad Maidan is situated within Oval Sub-Precinct of Fort Precinct listed at Sr. No. 633(13) of the heritage list. As per D.P remarks dated 31.01.2020 the plot(s) u/r is situated within buffer / vista of Grade-I heritage sites / structure.

**Proposal:** - It is informed that the existing steps (sitting tier) being in dilapidated condition were demolished on site to avoid any mishap. The proposal contemplates reconstruction of the said steps in same profile along the compound wall abutting Mahapalika Marg. The applicant has also attached NOC from Dy. Director, Sports and Youth Services, Mumbai Division for reconstruction of said steps (spectator gallery) wherein the NOC from the MHCC has been insisted. As per the submitted drawing, steps would be constructed in RCC with total height of 4.50 m up to parapet top for the stretch of 31.00m. Provision of toilet is also shown below the steps at both ends.

**Decision of the Committee in today's meeting:** - The Committee after due consideration, decided to grant its NOC purely from heritage point of view for the said proposal subject to authenticity and approvability of the proposal including user, open spaces. FSI etc being confirmed by concerned B.P. dept. as per prevailing DCPR and policies in force.

**5. Sr. No.: 444**

**Grade – Precinct**

**'Parsi Colony Precinct'**

Proposal: - Proposed construction of periphery wall at Five Garden play ground in beat no. 177 of F/N. Ward.

Applicant: - Assistant Commissioner F/N Ward.

Ref: - Application u/no Che/13634/DP-DyMA dated 31.08.2019.

The site u/r is part of 'Parsi Colony Precinct' listed at Sr. No. 444 in the sanctioned heritage list of F/N Ward.

**Proposal:** - The proposal contemplates construction of periphery wall at Five Garden Playground situated at beat no. 117 in F/N Ward. The scope of work contemplates construction of periphery wall (approx. 500 mm in height) around play ground at Five Garden to prevent washout of soil.

**Decision of the Committee:** - The proposal was discussed by the Committee and considering the utility of the wall, it was opined that height of up to 500mm could be granted in this case. Considering all, the MHCC decided to grant its NOC purely from heritage point of view for the said proposal subject to the following:

- i) that, it should be ensured that no tree is harmed at site during course of work;



- ii) that, this NOC is granted purely from heritage point of view and all other applicable permissions from concerned depts. should be obtained. Authenticity / approvability of the overall proposal including allowable construction in garden / playground should be got confirmed from concerned MCGM dept as per prevailing DCPR and policies in force;
- iii) that, Completion Certificate of the MHCC should be obtained after completion of work at site.

The meeting then concluded with a vote of thanks to the chair.



**Chairman**  
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee